FINAL

BUDGET ADVISORY BOARD REGULAR MEETING

City of Fort Lauderdale 100 North Andrews Avenue 8th Floor Conference Room Fort Lauderdale, Florida, 33301 April 21, 2010 - 6:00 p.m.

		10/2009 through 9/2010 Cumulative Attendance	
Board Member	Attendance	Р	Α
Keith Cobb, Chair	Р	6	0
June Page, Vice Chair	Р	6	0
Bud Bentley	Р	5	1
Marc Dickerman	Р	4	2
Nadine Hankerson	Р	2	0
Sam Monroe	А	3	3
Fred Nesbitt	Р	6	0
Alan Silva	Р	6	0
Anthony Timiraos	А	4	2
Ray Williams	Р	3	3

City Staff

Norm Mason, Staff Liaison, Assistant Budget Director John Herbst, City auditor Shonda Singleton-Taylor, Acting Director, Office of Management & Budget Fire Chief Jeff Justinak Paul Vanden Berge, Fire Rescue Department Budget Coordinator Eric Pologruto, Assistant Chief John Molenda, Assistant Fire Chief David Rains, Fire Marshall J. Opperlee, ProtoType Services

<u>Guests</u>

Fort Lauderdale Commissioner Bobby DuBose Fort Lauderdale Commissioner Bruce Roberts

Communications to the City Commission

None

<u>PURPOSE</u>: To Provide the City with input regarding the taxpayers' perspective in the development of the annual operating budget; to review projections and estimates from the City Manager regarding revenues and expenditures for upcoming fiscal year; to advise the City Commission on service levels and priorities and fiscal solvency; and to

submit recommendations to the City Commission no later than August 15 of each year regarding a budget for the upcoming fiscal year.

1. Call to Order/Roll Call

Chair Cobb called the meeting of the Budget Advisory Board to order at 6:00 p.m.

2. Review Meeting Minutes of March 31, 2010

Ms. Nesbitt noted corrections to the minutes.

Motion made by Mr. Williams, seconded by Mr. Dickerman, to approve the minutes of the Board's March 31, 2010 meeting as amended. In a voice vote, Board unanimously approved.

3. Fire-Rescue Activity Based Presentation

Fire Chief Justinak gave a PowerPoint presentation regarding the Fire Rescue Department, a copy of which is attached to these minutes for the public record.

4. Questions and Answers

Mr. Herbst said the audit had revealed that the cost of many inspections performed by the Fire Rescue Department should be covered under the building inspection permit revenue. Chief Justinak said Fire was currently covering these costs, but he intended to discuss this with Building Department Director Valerie Bohlander. Mr. David Rains, Fire Marshall, stated there were Building Department related issues that the fire inspectors responded to because of their expertise.

Mr. Herbst noted that in the past there had been a surplus in building permit revenue that should have been paid back to the State, but an argument had been made that there were costs associated with inspections in Fire Rescue, and he had assumed the Department would be getting some of these costs back.

Mr. Williams noted that the total Fire Rescue overtime costs equaled the salaries of approximately six people, and wondered if the Department had cut back too far on staff. Chief Justinak said the overtime was cost neutral. He said he would rather have the employees available than to rely on overtime.

Mr. Paul Vanden Berge, Fire Rescue Department Budget Coordinator, said they had tried to balance the timing between vacancies, training and salary savings. Chief

Justinak knew that most people did not understand that there was a vacancy offset for the overtime in most cases. He felt they were staffed well right now, with only a few vacancies in operations. Chief Justinak informed the Board that some of the overtime was reimbursed.

Chair Cobb calculated that overtime costs comprised 1.5% of payroll, so this was not a significant budget issue. Chief Justinak said a few years ago they had \$2.5 million per year in overtime, and they had made adjustments in staffing to manage this.

Chief Justinak agreed to provide the HazMat costs to the Board, and reminded them that the costs were for apparatus, equipment and relative training; the staff was already there and responded as needed.

Mr. Bentley noted that the County had just built a new fire station very close to where the City was rebuilding one on Southwest 4th Street near Snyder Park. Chief Justinak said he could not respond to what the County had done. They had held preliminary discussions on partnering in the past, but these had ultimately been unsuccessful.

Chief Justinak explained they were discussing alternatives with Oakland Park, but the problem was dispatch. There was currently a 60 to 90-second lag in re-routing to the alternate communication site that they were working on. Ms. Page asked about areas that were serviced by BSO. Chief Justinak stated they had been optimistic about stations 23 and 14 and had performed a cost analysis, but the challenge was the County Commission, who was unwilling to provide any funding to the City for annexation.

Ms. Page asked if providing service to Wilton Manors was cost neutral. Chief Justinak reported it was not, but they were working with David Hebert and putting together a plan. Mr. Bentley said the Office of Management and Budget and provided revenue information indicating that the revenue for Wilton Manors was \$1 million and the expense to provide the service was \$2 million, so it appeared that the City was subsidizing Wilton Manors by \$1 million. He said someone had mentioned that not renewing the contract would not actually save \$1 million because there were fixed expenses the City would have to pick up. Mr. Nesbitt pointed out that 30% of the calls to that station were from Fort Lauderdale. Mr. Vanden Berge explained his cost analysis for Wilton Manors and showed the service areas and how he segregated call volume and related costs.

Mr. Silva asked who performed fire inspections in Wilton Manors. Chief Justinak said currently, Wilton Manors performed its own inspections and investigations, but there were times when Fort Lauderdale supplemented. Chief Molenda was working with

Wilton Manors regarding possibly providing these services in the future. Mr. Rains stated Wilton Manors used Fort Lauderdale personnel and paid them directly for inspections and investigations. Mr. Herbst pointed out that there was value to the building Wilton Manors provided at no cost, so it was as if they were making additional payments. Mr. Vanden Berge said he had not taken this into account.

Mr. Nesbitt asked if the cost recovery in the 2005 contract with Wilton Manors was the same in 2009 or if it had declined. Chief Justinak thought it was an automatic renewal and was not aware if an analysis was performed.

Ms. Page asked if the Fire Rescue Department had input to the City Commission regarding expenditure of the Fire Assessment Fee. Chief Justinak explained that he discussed the Department's needs with Mr. Hebert and the City then made decisions based on those discussions.

Chief Justinak confirmed that 54% of the Fire Rescue budget was for Fire alone. Mr. Silva asked about the cost to provide EMS service and cost recovery for EMS. Chief Justinak said there were staffing factors to consider because they were a supplement to the resources they had cut back on the operational end that were technically dedicated to Fire, which could be covered under the Fire Assessment Fee, but could not be under EMS. He stated they focused on response times, staffing at the minimum acceptable levels on as many units as possible in order to provide responses that met the standard.

Mr. Silva asked what percentage of the EMS runs were cost recovered. Mr. Vanden Berge said 76% was a fair estimate, in terms of transport costs only, not for providing EMS service. Mr. Silva said cost recovery for EMS service was approximately 20%. Mr. Silva noted that some communities ran EMS as enterprise funds and charges to various insurance programs covered 100% of the costs. He wondered if they should be considering this in Fort Lauderdale. Chief Justinak said this could be discussed with Mr. Hebert.

Mr. Nesbitt asked for an explanation of NFPA standard 1710. Chief Justinak explained that this standard concerned single-story residential structures response times and staffing levels. He stated Fort Lauderdale was 18 and the standard was 15 to 19. He added that they were "right on the cusp" of the response time per 1710. The standard was 90% at 5 minutes or less and Fort Lauderdale was 90% at 6 minutes or less.

Mr. Bentley asked why a fire truck and EMS unit responded to an accident. Chief Justinak explained that the units served different functions. Depending on the call, different resources were needed. Chief Justinak recommended Board members ride

with the Department to understand "what happens in reality" in an uncontrolled environment.

Ms. Hankerson asked what the Department would need to be at the top level of efficiency. Chief Justinak felt this would include increasing the number of personnel on a rescue to three.

Chief Justinak reported that there were 382 sworn firefighters; the remaining 58 personnel were civilian.

Mr. Nesbitt asked what percentage of \$860,000 budgeted for overtime was reimbursed. Mr. Vanden Berge estimated \$250,000 to \$300,000 was recovered, and this went into the Fire Rescue budget, not the General Fund. Chief Molenda stated the Urban Search and Rescue Team trained on a volunteer basis; there was no cost to the City, and when they responded, the City was reimbursed by FEMA. He remarked that all of the training and expertise was then a benefit to the City.

5. Discussion to revise presentation dates for Parks & Recreation and Public Works

Mr. Mason explained that Parks and Recreation would now make their presentation on May 19 and Public Works would make theirs on June 16.

6. Discussion regarding meeting scheduled for April 29, 2010

Chair Cobb wanted the Board to review the information from the presentations and to see where they should go from there. Prior to their response to the City Commission, the Board desired a presentation from the Office of Management and Budget explaining how real costs for fees for service were calculated. Ms. Singleton-Taylor stated they would provide this analysis and fee schedule to the City Commission on May 15.

Mr. Silva reminded the Board that the City Commission wanted the Board to agree with the City Manager's language regarding net budget support. Chair Cobb agreed to add this to their next agenda.

Mr. Nesbitt reminded the Board they needed to look at the four items Vice Mayor Rogers had asked them to consider. Ms. Page wanted to determine which of the Board's recommendations the City Commission had not agreed to adopt. Mr. Williams requested the City Manager give them an update on the status of their recommendations. Mr. Nesbitt also requested a report from the committee that handled surplus property. Chair Cobb agreed to contact the City Manager to request a report on

the status of all of the Board's recommendations. Mr. Silva asked him to contact the City Attorney pursuant to their questions regarding collective bargaining.

7. Communication to the Commission

None

With no further business to come before the Board, the meeting was adjourned at **8:07** p.m.

Next meeting: April 29, 2010

[Minutes prepared by J. Opperlee, Prototype, Inc.]