

**CITY COMMISSION SPECIAL REGULAR MEETING  
AIR AND SEA SHOW  
CITY HALL – 8<sup>TH</sup> FLOOR CONFERENCE ROOM  
FORT LAUDERDALE, FL**

**MAY 21, 2004 – 1:00 PM**

---

Mayor Naugle called to order the special regular meeting of May 21, 2004 at approximately 1:10 p.m. Roll was called and a quorum was present.

Present: Mayor Naugle  
Commissioner Teel  
Commissioner Trantalis  
Commissioner Hutchinson  
Commissioner Moore

Absent: None

Also Present: City Attorney  
City Clerk  
Sergeant At Arms – Sergeant

Commissioner Hutchinson stated they knew that the City needed assistance in helping to fund their cost for the Air and Sea Show. She stated that the business community, especially those on the Beach, understood that this had been a great event over time and that they had made profits due to the show, and were now willing to step up to the plate and assist the City. She suggested they come up with two sheets. One with a show staffed perfectly, and one with a staffed adequately. She stated that this year's show had been short of manpower. She stated they needed to forget the in-kind services, and they should be built into the costs for the City because individuals were being taken away from jobs they did on a daily basis. She stated further that she wanted every department to arrive at a figure for the cost for the show so a realistic number could be provided to the business community as to what they were looking to spend on the event. She felt they needed to have some healthy dialogue at this meeting in order to see where they were headed regarding this matter. She believed that things could be worked out.

Bud Bentley, Assistant City Manager, stated that they knew early on that Johnny Williams and Mr. Markoff would not be able to attend today's meeting, but he had encouraged the Commissioner that the meeting still be held because it was important for everyone to understand what services the City provided and why they did so for the event. He stated that the event had grown and changed incrementally over the 10 years, and he felt this would give everyone the opportunity to step back and look at the services provided.

Mr. Bentley further stated they had asked the departments to describe what level of service they were providing. The Commission would then be able to hear what got charged and what was in-kind. He added that several of the departments also had suggestions regarding services that did not have to be provided by the City. He

## Air and Sea Show

explained that in the past MDM had asked the City to provide certain services because they did them well, and then MDM did not have the responsibility to provide those services.

Linda Gill thanked the Commission and Mr. Bentley for organizing today's meeting. She stated that this involved all of Broward County because of the media coverage. She stated that Pete Witschen, who was also part of their group, asked if he could participate in today's meeting via the telephone since he was home from the hospital recuperating.

Mr. Bentley proceeded to patch-in Mr. Witschen to the meeting.

Linda Gill explained they were attempting to work positively with the City and see what could be done to help out so the burden would not fall onto the City.

Commissioner Teel stated that the taxpayers wanted to know the actual costs no matter who was paying for it.

Carol Lombard, Parks and Recreation, stated that they had separated things into two components. She explained there were the overtime costs for during the event in which Parks and Recreation had provided clean-up services. She stated that in the past they had tried using some private contractors, but they found that the event was too large and the companies were focusing on small details instead of the "big picture." She stated that this year only Parks staff had been utilized. She explained that in order to reduce the overtime costs, they did not have a full staff from the beginning of the show as in the past, and only brought staff on around 5:00 p.m. She stated that in the past they emptied the garbage containers as they filled and took them to the dumpster, but this year they overflowed and garbage went on the ground, and therefore, they ended up shoveling the debris. She explained further they had scheduled carefully with Public Services to do the work.

Commissioner Hutchinson stated that they had attempted to reduce the overtime costs by having the crews come in later, but asked if the crews should be at the sites earlier than 5:00 p.m. Ms. Lombard agreed. Commissioner Hutchinson stated she did not think that service should be outsourced because the City's crews took ownership of the Beach and did a very good job. Ms. Lombard stated if there was a company they could outsource to, then she would be willing to try that but their experience had shown differently. Commissioner Hutchinson reiterated that some overtime would have to be paid in order for the crews to begin at a more appropriate hour than 5:00 p.m.

Commissioner Teel asked if there had been an opportunity to have additional containers available. Ms. Lombard explained that they brought in about 300 additional aluminum containers because the cardboard containers were useless when wet.

Ina Lee, Chair of the Beach Redevelopment Advisory Board, asked if there had been adequate coverage the previous year. Ms. Lombard confirmed and stated that at Sunrise and A1A, they had used some contractors and additional staff.

Commissioner Hutchinson asked at what time would staff have normally started. Ms. Lombard replied they normally began work at 11:00 a.m. She explained that the Beach crew began at 4:00 a.m. or 5:00 a.m. because they had to place all the containers in the area, along with the liners, while still doing the regular beach raking before the crowds

## Air and Sea Show

began to arrive. She further stated that before the event, many things had to be done such as protecting the sea oak beds according to Federal regulations, signage throughout the City regarding parking, auxiliary lifeguard stands, and depending who the major act was determining if they had to drag any trailers onto the beach. She advised that this year that had not been necessary. She further explained that the Monday after the show they brought in staff from all over to assist with clean-up and re-open the roadway.

Ms. Lombard explained that the major labor issue on straight time and overtime was setting up the barricades. She stated if there was any way to contract that out to save staff hours, they would do so. Mr. Bentley asked if staff could clarify what all was involved. Ms. Lombard stated that Brian and Jeff had coordinated the barricade work.

Brian Dooling stated that they basically started on Thursday and earlier because they had to pick-up the barricades on Shotgun Road. He explained they began blocking off the areas around George English to keep individuals off the swales, and they focused on the French barricade which were the corrals used for bus loading and unloading. He stated they used mowing crews which totaled about 12-14 individuals and 4-5 trucks with large trailers. He further stated that on Friday they did the water barricades which went over the bridges to keep the pedestrian and VIP lanes opened. He explained those barricades totaled about 520 and also had to be picked up and brought to the site.

The Acting City Manager asked why the promoter did not contract for those separately. Brian Dooling stated they did not know. Commissioner Hutchinson stated that she believed Phil Thornburg had informed her that the City was able to do it cheaper. She thought the City's expense was \$7500 versus \$30,000. Brian Dooling stated it was his understanding that the barricades were donated and the City set them up. He reiterated then everything went into reverse after the event.

Linda Gill asked if the \$7500 figure mentioned was for the cost of the services or the barricades, and was it an exact figure. Ms. Lombard stated that it cost about \$8,000 for labor in connection with the barricades. Commissioner Hutchinson asked if that also included the barricades. Ms. Lombard stated that she believed the City paid for the water barricades totaling \$2700 (this year), but Mr. Markoff had the rest donated. The Acting City Manager asked if that cost was included in what the City charged him. Ms. Lombard confirmed. Mr. Bentley stated the \$2700 was included, but the \$8,000 was not because those services were done with existing staff. Ms. Lombard clarified that the \$8,000 was included in the overtime figure. The Acting City Manager asked how much was it in straight time. Ms. Lombard explained some were on overtime and some were on straight time. She stated that most of the barricades were set up at night when traffic was slower and those were done on overtime.

Mr. Bentley explained that one of the things that staff was working on was having all this documented.

Ms. Lombard clarified that there was about \$8,000 in overtime, and about \$8,000 in straight time also. The Acting City Manager clarified that included both the set-up and the removal of the barricades.

Mr. Bentley further stated that the City could do it cheaper, but they did it also because when the City did it Mr. Markoff did not have to monitor the situation knowing that the

## Air and Sea Show

City would get it done correctly. Otherwise, his employees would have to contract and oversee it. The Acting City Manager stated that Mr. Markoff could contract for it, and then the City could only have 1 person monitoring the work.

Jeff Meehan stated that most of his time was in regard to Kids Day which took place on Thursday and Friday. He stated that a lot of straight time was involved with that set-up.

Brian Dooling added that the Facility Maintenance Crews were used to set-up and take down bike racks that were used.

Commissioner Teel asked how the regular duties for those individuals got caught up, such as the mowing. Brian Dooling stated that it depended how fast the grass grew as to how long it would take them to get caught up.

Linda Gill stated that in the past staffing had not been adequate, and she asked in order to make it adequate, what would they be looking at for such an increase. Ms. Lombard stated that last year it ran very smooth and they had good weather.

Commissioner Hutchinson announced that last year Parks and Recreation was \$92,000. Linda Gill asked why that figure had doubled since 2000. Ms. Lombard replied there was a difference in scope, and the barricades had been added from Public Services so costs were transferred from one division to another. Commissioner Hutchinson stated that between 2002 and 2003, there had been a difference of almost \$20,000.

Bruce Roberts, Chief Police Department, stated they had also used the Trustees when they had the jail in the past. Ms. Lombard stated that manhole covers were included last year also.

Greg Slagle, Public Services/Sanitation Division, stated that most of their work was done on the midnight shift. He explained they had about 19 hours of management time included. He stated they came in on Saturday night working until 7:00 a.m. on clean-up, and then on Sunday night at 10:00 p.m. they did final clean-up. He explained that they contracted with a private contractor for dumpsters and approximately 18 were placed in the beach area. During the day, Parks placed the bags in the dumpsters with the trash, and on the night shift they cleaned the medians and swept the streets. He explained their focus went to Oakland Park Boulevard and down to South Beach. Then, all the garbage was hauled out. He stated that also bags of trash were set along the sidewalks, and then he had a truck pick those up. He explained that the dumpster service ran about \$3400 which included the placement of the dumpsters, the emptying, and the disposal.

Mr. Slagle further stated that the trash picked up by City crews went to the Wheel-a-Brator Plant, and they spent about \$4,000 in disposal fees at that site. He explained that the street sweepers then went to the landfill and they spent another \$700 to dispose of that material. In order to accomplish all that, personnel was on overtime and they spent about \$7,000. Mr. Bentley asked if any of that expense included a machine charge. Mr. Slagle confirmed and stated that amounted to about \$1500 for equipment charges. It was stated that for 2003, the \$8,678 had been included on the bill for disposal costs. Ms. Lombard explained that the equipment costs had always been taken out and in-kind costs were done. She stated that she had never charged the promoter for the equipment.

## Air and Sea Show

The Acting City Manager asked in regard to the dumpsters, the picking up of trash, transferring it to the stations, and payment for the disposal, were within the costs borne by the promoter.

Mr. Bentley clarified that those charges were included in the City's total direct expense, but MDM had not paid those for about 8 years.

Ms. Gill asked if those charges had been included in the figures the City distributed the other day. Mr. Bentley confirmed and stated it was included in the total direct expense. Ms. Gill stated that the expense for those charges this year appeared to total \$19,747 which was lower than last year. She asked if such services had been adequate this year. Mr. Slagle stated they had made some changes recently. In the past they had used City staff from the trash transfer station using their own containers and trucks. However, they began tweaking the service and decided to contract out the dumpster service, which helped to reduce some of the cost. He felt the manpower provided had been adequate for what they were responsible for.

Ms. Lombard clarified that she was not sure about the \$8,000 in disposal, and if it had been included in the estimate provided on Tuesday. She stated that she would check on that matter.

The Acting City Manager asked if the same company that had been used for the contracting out of dumpsters took the trash to the disposal site and paid for such disposal. He clarified that the City did not reimburse them for that. Mr. Slagle stated that there was a City dumpster contract which serviced all the City buildings, and in that contract he had included special events and services, but they could contract with them at the City rate. He explained it was all considered garbage and went to the Wheel-a-Brator Plant. He stated they were given a set price per yard which included the container and the disposal. He explained that staff emptied sidewalk trash cans and such trucks also went to the incinerator plant. He stated that on the City side they spent about \$4,000 in disposal fees for picking up City trash. The Acting City Manager stated that as far as the private contractors were concerned, the promoter could contract that out himself, and the City would not have to do it since they normally did not, excluding the \$4,000 just mentioned. Mr. Slagle confirmed.

Mr. Bentley explained there were two components to Public Services.

Tom Terrell, Maintenance Division, stated that their group included the carpenters, electricians, and the typical trades. He stated their part began two weeks before the event. He explained they had to pick up the platforms for the central stage and the ramps, and then they began repairing them. He explained further those were in-kind costs. He added that about a week before the road closed, they began installing the speakers, and once the road closed they did the electric for the vendor area and the show central area. He explained they also did the wiring for the FAA and other parts of the show central. He further stated that the plumbers then converted the showers in the area to temporary drinking fountains. They also hooked up the sewer sanitary section of the crowd pleasers in the show area, along with the ADA ramps. He stated they also did the a/c hook-ups for the show central area for the HazMat Team, Public Safety Tag, and for the show area. He explained that work was all done at straight time both before and after the event.

## Air and Sea Show

Mr. Bentley stated if it was straight time such costs would show up under in-kind services. Mr. Terrell confirmed.

The Acting City Manager commented that such employees were taken from critical duties, such as working on the fire station, in order to do such work for the event. He asked further if any of those things done could have been contracted out by the promoter. He asked why was the City doing it instead. Mr. Terrell stated he did not know that answer. He believed that most of the work could be handled by an outside contractor provided the correct supervision was in place.

Mr. Bentley asked how much interaction did the City crews have with MDM regarding such work. Mr. Terrell replied their interaction was usually with Jack Bolan. He stated they did interface with MDM, along with the FAA, Fire and Police, and of course Show Central. He explained that most of their instruction came from Jack Bolan through Parks since he interfaced more with MDM. Mr. Bentley stated that one of the Parks employees who had worked for a long time with this show was Jack Bolan who was now retired from the City, and worked for MDM. He explained that he now had a greater capacity to take over and contract with other individuals since there was an expert person on staff. Commissioner Hutchinson stated that since he now had Jack Bolan, there would be an opportunity for him to do such work.

Commissioner Teel asked if any numbers had been applied to such work. Mr. Terrell stated the figures did not include FICA and supervisory costs, and the hourly costs for labor only this year was over \$12,000. He stated they were in-kind costs. He added there had been some material costs which they would not be able to recover such as nails. He stated that the overtime costs that were to be recovered this year, not including supervisory costs, were \$3700.

Ms. Gill asked if that was included in the in-kind costs. Mr. Bentley explained that overtime would be shown in the "total direct expense."

Mr. Bentley stated that FICA would be added to the figures in the final process.

Mr. Terrell reiterated that their costs were reduced this year because they had transferred all overtime costs associated with barricade placement to the Parks Department.

Commissioner Hutchinson stated that ultimately, if the promoter did all the set-up for the show, other than having a supervisor in place, there could be less work for this department. She added that possibly the day of the show would require some expert personnel on hand, unless that also was contracted out. Mr. Terrell stated that if they installed the equipment, then they should be present during the event. He explained that most of their work involved skilled trades.

Mr. Bentley stated they were sensitive of the criticism of MDM that the City provided too much service and should make them pay for it. Ms. Gill stated that she had not heard such comments. She stated that they want services out there, but don't want things included that were not necessary. She explained they had looked at the increases over the years. Mr. Bentley reiterated that they had changed how they did business and had improved the site each year, but part of such improvements included additional City services. Ms. Gill reiterated that was what they were all trying to understand.

## Air and Sea Show

Mr. Terrell stated there was a third element to the Public Services Department which was the Public Utilities Department. It was stated that a crew used to be assigned to the Beach in case of a water main break, but about 2-3 years ago that was stopped and a management employee had been on site for 2 days during this event. Only daily costs had been charged.

Otis Latin, Chief Fire-Rescue, stated that they had attempted to stay within the budget, and they had a good history of equipment and personnel that were necessary for the event. He stated they had to look at the show area as if it was a city because the City itself still had to function. He explained there was no in-kind of such units during the show. He stated they had to show what personnel had been hired in to staff the appropriate equipment for the beach. He added they also had to have the command personnel present on the scene, and they were in-kind services which were not normally reimbursed. He explained those individuals were brought in off-duty because additional command personnel were necessary.

Commissioner Hutchinson clarified that such costs were coming out of the Fire Department's budget. Chief Latin confirmed.

Chief Latin further stated that they looked at the situation from 3 levels. A pre-show, the show, and a post-show in-kind. He explained there were a lot of hours during the pre-show because there were a lot of meetings held, and in the support services area in the pre-planning and preparing equipment for the site, along with the necessary personnel staffing such equipment. He added that supplies had to be put on the reserve units for the event.

Commissioner Hutchinson asked if such items had been shown in the past under in-kind services. Chief Latin explained it was shown through the \$18,000 figure, but reiterated it was not reimbursed. He further stated that this year they had Ocean Rescue and their cost was about \$26,000 for those services. He added that the total cost for EMS operations was about \$69,000. He stated that total costs, exclusive of in-kind services, was about \$95,000.

Jeff Justinek, Ocean Rescue, stated that their in-kind involved the functioning days of the event, along with the pre-show and post-show services. He stated their primary responsibility was for coverage of the Beach from 20<sup>th</sup> and auxiliary towers and staff were added for the event. He stated their typical staffing days were about 19-22, but at this event they supplied 75-76 people. He stated that this year was unusual due to the weather conditions. He stated that this year's staff was probably not adequate and they had the "heck beat out of them." He clarified there were 75 personnel per day that were used for this event. He added they also used part-time individuals, and lifeguards were also hired throughout the country. He stated their hard dollars were at \$26,000, but they supplied 556 hours of in-kind services and only a portion was built into the original in-kind services.

The Acting City Manager stated that when they discussed the difference between the in-kind and the reimbursed, he asked if the in-kind was the 19-22 individuals normally on duty, plus the difference between the 75 and 22. Therefore, they were being billed for 55 individuals. Mr. Justinek explained there were a variety of things and he believed they had discussed an A,B, and C for in-kind services. He stated that with the workload

## Air and Sea Show

increase, there was a tremendous amount of work placed on the individuals working which was category A. He explained that "B" was typical in-kind services that were not staffed but came in to accommodate for the preparation. Then, there were in-kind services for management which were normally not measured in regard to the hard dollar costs.

Mr. Bentley asked if any local municipalities provided any of their work force for the event. Mr. Justinek confirmed, but stated it was based more on the solicitation of the Captain assigned who made those contacts. He explained they were paid a flat hourly rate, but the uniforms were provided for the weekend and they did bill for such uniforms.

Ms. Gill asked if they had any idea about the in-kind services being supplied. Mr. Justinek explained there were 556 total hours of in-kind services. He stated that was for the working days, but did not include the pre-show or post-show days.

Chief Latin stated they were going to attempt to separate those and come up with a more definite number. He explained they had not yet put together the actual cost.

Bob Edgar, Fire-Rescue, EMS Division Chief, stated he was responsible for setting up the EMS and fire operations for the show. He stated they began two months in advance for preparation of the show, including meetings, supplies, and overtime hiring of personnel. He stated they were very limited in staff and this required a lot of their regular work time. He explained they had about 2,000 hours involved in the show, and they would work out the numbers and submit them. He explained further that once the equipment and supplies were ready, they began to set up 7 first-aid sites along the beach area, and brought in engines to the beach to cover any type of fire which could occur that would prevent the on-duty units to gain access to the area due to the crowds and the show. He added they also set up fire-rescue units in case an individual needed to go to the hospital, as well as 7 detail carts placed on the beach. He explained they also set up a medical hospital in Birch State Park and they past that cost off to MDM. He stated they did not reduce any staff for this year's event, except for the inflatable boats they normally put in the Intracoastal containing 2 paramedics, and divers. He added that the back-up HazMat team had also been eliminated this year. Since 9/11 they had staffed such a team in the event some type of WMD event would have occurred since the event was identified as a terrorist target. He explained that the threat level was low this year, and therefore they eliminated that team from their work force. He explained there was a HazMat team on duty, along with others throughout the County.

Commissioner Hutchinson asked if there was a possibility of breaking down those costs separately in case such services would be required in the future. Ms. Gill asked if those services were used only during a specified alert level. Commissioner Hutchinson confirmed. Chief Edgar explained that was what had been done in the past. He further explained the nation was presently at a yellow alert, and once it increased after that level, then they were on a higher alert. He further clarified that a "red" alert was identified for a specific area and would not be country-wide.

Commissioner Teel asked if there had been additional traffic on the Intracoastal this year due to the seas being extremely high. Chief Edgar stated that the high winds created a problem for Ocean Rescue also, and their Fire-Rescue boat was unable to go offshore. He stated that the Coast Guard and the Police had their boats in the area and all traffic was covered.



Ms. Gill asked if the other agencies who brought in their boats submitted a cost.

Bruce Roberts, Chief Police Department, stated they did not and came in as mutual aid at the City's request. He stated the other agencies made up about 100 additional personnel on the days of the event, logging in about 1800 hours for such personnel that was not paid for. Ms. Gill asked if those services were provided on a volunteer basis. Chief Roberts explained they were paid by their jurisdiction under mutual aid. Ms. Gill asked if police from other areas were also participants. Chief Roberts confirmed and stated that this year Miami, BSO, Wilton Manors, Boca Raton, Coral Springs, and Pembroke Pines had assisted. He explained that they did not provide a lot of personnel but they supplied what they could. He stated it was tough to plan on and help keep the costs down because one was never sure how many individuals would be offered in mutual aid. He reiterated that last year BSO did not participate, but this year they had provided 24 people each day.

Chief Roberts advised that they began their planning for this event in January, especially in their work with the FAA, FBI, and the Military Intelligence Services.

Commissioner Teel asked if the other agencies made commitments that early in the year. Chief Roberts stated they did not receive commitments until about March. He stated that the Federal agencies were a part of the planning from the beginning, but their functions were different. He stated that Miami was the first to offer their assistance and that had been in April.

The Acting City Manager asked what was the mutual aid on the fire side for this year. He stated that it had been mentioned that some apparatus had been stationed on the Barrier Island, and he asked if that left certain times empty outside of the Barrier Island, and if so, would mutual aid assist in such matters. Chief Latin stated they did not take any equipment from the City. All equipment used on the Barrier Island were reserve units and overtime people were used to staff that equipment. He stated they had sent out a request to their mutual aid partners in order to have back-up in case there were not enough individuals volunteering for the overtime. He stated one of the problems with the furloughs and sick leave was that if an individual worked, they could end up getting straight time as opposed to overtime. He remarked that the mutual aid services also requested overtime. He reiterated it was better for the City to use their own personnel if possible.

Commissioner Hutchinson stated that since it was mutual aid, would not the various departments have to pay for their personnel. Chief Latin stated that they had a mutual aid agreement, but those people would come in if the City equipment was down. He stated they were not going to move in their equipment to the City stations, while City personnel went to the Beach for the event. He stated also that they would not work the Beach either because their cities would not permit it.

The Acting City Manager asked if there were any individuals from other cities that assisted and paid for by the City. Chief Latin replied there were none.

The Acting City Manager explained that the reserve equipment was normally stripped down when not in use, and when they decided to put a piece of such equipment back into operation, there was a monumental amount of work to get it to an operational stage.

## Air and Sea Show

Chief Latin explained that all reserve equipment and apparatus were put in those vehicles to be taken to the Beach for the event. Commissioner Hutchinson asked if that was included in the \$18,000 for staff time. The Acting City Manager and Chief Latin confirmed.

Chief Roberts proceeded to distribute information regarding costs to the Commission. He stated the figures compared costs from last year to this year. He stated they could ignore the figures for Fleet Week since they were only discussing the Air & Sea Show. He explained there was an overtime column and an in-kind cost column included on the sheets. He explained that each category was listed, along with the costs. He stated that the bottom line, including in-kind and overtime costs, was the \$246,519 shown on the sheet. He stated the number of hours was also listed for each category involved. He stated they had attempted to reduce costs this year as much as possible. He explained that this year the threat level was way down, and last year during the entire planning process the nation had been at an "orange" alert. Also, the USS Cole had been in Port. Intelligence felt that Al Quida would come back in, as they did with the World Trade Center, and attempt to finish the job. Therefore, the military was concerned about the safety of the crew even off the ship. He advised that last year they had received very little mutual aid support, but this year there was a sizeable amount. Therefore, he stated it was hard to plan in that regard. He added that they did not pay for mutual aid.

Ina Lee asked if the nation went back to "orange" alert would they go back to the \$439,000 figure. Chief Roberts replied that would not be the case because they were comfortable that they could function in the range of \$275,000 to \$300,000 in the planning stages. He remarked that flexibility was needed since they did not know exactly what the level would be. He stated they were comfortable with the service that had been provided, unless more resources were desired. He stated they would provide back-up in regard to exact costs. He explained that a lot of the in-kind costs had the same factors involved such as command time during planning and officers already on duty in the area. He stated that this year they had also used Public Safety Aides and other civilians from other areas of the City using them to help in traffic control at the Air and Sea Show sites. He stated that the site began beyond the east side of the bridge and that has always been a contention with the promoter as to the exact area of the show site. He reminded everyone that they still had to protect the neighborhoods in the area which was included in the in-kind costs.

Linda Gill stated that this year traffic appeared to be a problem, and asked how it was different from previous years. Chief Roberts explained that had been one of the areas in which they had made some cutbacks. He stated the other thing was that the weather prohibited the boats in the water in certain areas causing more problems with the bridges due to additional boats being in the Intracoastal. Chief Roberts stated that if the weather had been better, the boats could have been in the ocean and this plan would have been perfect, and there would have been no issues with traffic. He explained they could not lock down the bridges and still had to abide by the Coast Guard's control.

Ina Lee asked what the costs had been when officers had been posted out to I-95. Chief Roberts stated they could provide such information because they had a list of the exact divisions which had been deleted each day.

## Air and Sea Show

Chief Roberts added they did not have many problems out west, but had sent officers there due to the fact they had physical limitations to the east. He advised they had not had the normal back-out in the west.

Chief Roberts stated one never really knew what was occurring out there, and he felt staffing levels spoke for themselves due to the success of the show over the last 10 years. One thing encountered this year was use of the bomb squad due to people seeing knapsacks and the like being left unattended, along with some dummy hand-grenades being found. He stated the most disconcerting incident had been on Sunday when an Arabic-looking male had left his backpack on the Beach and had walked away. The bomb squad responded and had found a Jordanian passport with a one-way airline ticket from Detroit to Ft. Lauderdale. The man showed up and the joint teams handled the incident. He stated that he could safely say this individual would not be allowed back into the country. He reiterated one never knew what was happening or what could occur. They might have been tested for all they knew. Therefore, they needed to be careful in supplying personnel and be comfortable with the levels supplied. He did not think they should go below this year's levels.

Commissioner Hutchinson stated that if more personnel were necessary, then they needed to be told. Chief Roberts stated they could work with \$250,000 to \$300,000, unless people wanted different levels of service.

Commissioner Hutchinson reiterated that the business group needed a true number to work towards.

Commissioner Teel asked if those figures included all in-kind services. Chief Roberts confirmed.

The Acting City Manager stated that at the previous Commission meeting he attempted to make the point that every pay period each person had a different overtime rate to base the calculations on depending on what was included, such as shift differential and whether a person worked out of rank or not. He stated it was a "moving target." He stated they had to make sure the books were closed when the figures were supplied.

Mr. Bentley stated that it had been suggested in the past that MDM be responsible for arranging all public safety for the show. He stated that would not be feasible, but the ultimate risk lay with the Commission. Commissioner Hutchinson stated she was not willing to take such a risk.

Chief Roberts stated they were committed every year to try and reduce costs through mutual aid, but it was difficult to plan since they did not make their commitments known until later.

Ms. Gill stated it was hard to go out and solicit funds, if they did not have numbers to work from. She asked regarding the trash pick-up, how much additional was needed. Ms. Lombard stated that she believed an \$8,000 figure had not been included in their estimate regarding Public Services. Commissioner Hutchinson stated the pick-up of trash was fine, but she felt it was the increase of Park staff coming in at an appropriate hour to begin their work that was the question.

## Air and Sea Show

Ms. Lombard stated there could be a cost savings if MDM took over the barricades. Ms. Gill asked if they could have an idea of such figure from last year when the work force began at 11:00 a.m. instead of 5:00 p.m., and stated that even 1:00 p.m. would be workable.

Mr. Bentley stated that parking was not present today but through the efforts of many individuals, they had raised \$43,000 which had been deducted from MDM's bill. He stated that Kim Clifford would explain how that worked.

Kim Clifford explained there were a number of parking locations in the City, and they deducted their expenses from the revenue, and arrived at the parking revenue for that time. During a typical weekend, she stated whatever money was collected they subtracted out that for a typical weekend before subtracting their expenses.

Mr. Bentley reiterated that the City did all that work in regard to parking and arranged for the buses. He stated that the buses were contracted through the County.

Ms. Gill asked how things had been handled by the Galleria. She stated they had discussed the issue for next year with them and they were going to permit parking.

The Acting City Manager stated he was concerned about using parking revenues to offset what the promoter owed to the City. Ms. Gill stated they were additional parking revenues which the City would not normally get, and the show was a benefit to the community, its citizens, and the businesses. She stated if they were charging everything else back and getting compensated, why not include the additional revenues. The Acting City Manager clarified they were not charging everything else back. He stated there were a significant amount of in-kind contributions being made, and there would still be more than \$40,000 of in-kind costs associated with the show. He stated it was a different fund. He explained the Parking Fund was an Enterprise Fund and ran as a business, and asked why it had to be taken away in order to subsidize the General Fund. He did not think that made sense.

Mr. Bentley reiterated they were holding them harmless, and they were still getting their normal weekend revenues. He stated that one of the things they were going to do was work with the departments on the in-kind services, and calculate those expenses. Then, they would restate this year's expenses so there would be a better picture of the true costs of what was being devoted to the Air and Sea Show.

Ms. Gill clarified they were going to break out the in-kind of what was normally there, and what was additional and add it to the costs. Mr. Bentley confirmed. He further stated that the 20 lifeguards already on the Beach would remain as in-kind. Chief Roberts stated if they had officers already assigned to the Beach as their normal area, they were not shown as in-kind services. He stated if they had officers or PSAs in another part of the City and they were drawn from their normal duties, then they were shown as in-kind. Ms. Gill stated that was not how the rest of the City figured their in-kind costs.

Commissioner Hutchinson suggested that each department figure their costs the same so as to have some sort of consistency. Mr. Bentley confirmed.

The Acting City Manager stated that such in-kind services should be shown as a City contribution.

Chief Roberts explained the reason they had not included those was because they still had responsibilities outside the area of the show, and they did not commit them to the security of the show per se.

The Acting City Manager asked about the lifeguards. Mr. Justinek stated that would be the "A" component of the A,B,C and they only charged for the B and C because A was already there working.

Ina Lee asked in regard to other major events such as the Boat Parade and Winterfest were people normally moved from one area to another in order to accommodate an occurring event. Chief Roberts stated that those events were covered mostly by the detail and paid the detail rate.

Commissioner Teel asked if there was a tendency by other jurisdictions to say it was a special event known in advance for a profit promoter, and it should not be classified as an emergency for aid. Chief Roberts stated they asked for mutual aid in connection with their police operation, but if it was a detail they would not have such latitude to make that request. He stated they would have no authority to ask for aid, if it was not a police operation. He advised that it did not have to be an emergency for aid, and only had to be a large scale police operation.

The Acting City Manager asked why they did not pay for mutual aid on the police side, but paid for it on the fire side. Chief Latin explained from the standpoint of mutual aid, the other cities used to assist when the show was new, but now it was "old hat." He stated that if there was a second alarm in the City during the show and additional people were needed for assistance, they would readily come in and assist. He stated they would not send their people in that were not going to get paid for the show. The Acting City Manager stated that BSO was willing to send 24 officers, and they were also in control of the fire but they would not send a fire-rescue truck to assist. Chief Latin stated they would send someone if the City paid them on an overtime rate.

Chief Roberts stated there were many times during the year when mutual aid was given, especially on the police side. He felt there was less exercising of mutual aid on any significant scale with fire. He stated that during the year there were many multi-jurisdictional investigations, FTAA, Civil Services, and many things which made it a normal part of law enforcement, than perhaps fire. Mr. Bentley reiterated that fire had to find a rescue unit and staff it, and it was more difficult to do so. Chief Latin remarked that no one had a lot of extra resources for such things.

Mr. Bentley reiterated that they would put together new documentation that would update all information.

Ms. Gill asked if anyone had ever asked the other cities if they would help with the cost since it was a County event. Mr. Bentley stated they could ask, but their answer would be what was the contribution from the County. The Acting City Manager stated that the people that should be on the books were the County and the Convention Bureau. Ms. Gill stated that ARVO, one of the biggest conventions they ever had, for the past 4 years had been at the same time as this show. Therefore, they lost business.

Air and Sea Show

Commissioner Hutchinson stated that she had not yet spoken with the County, but was going to do so.

Ina Lee stated that there were other major events that would have to be opened up to the Convention Bureau, and many years ago they got out of sponsoring major events. Ms. Gill stated there were opportunities and there was great media coverage.

It was stated that when the Convention and Visitors Bureau presented their annual plan, they used footage and publicity from the Air and Sea Show and it was hard to separate the County from the City as a tourist destination.

Ms. Gill thanked everyone for their hard work in helping them to understand the situation more clearly.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 2:45 p.m.