

**HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD
CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE
MONDAY, AUGUST 3, 2009 - 5:00 P.M.
CITY HALL FIRST FLOOR CONFERENCE ROOM
100 NORTH ANDREWS AVENUE
FORT LAUDERDALE, FLORIDA**

<u>Board Members</u>	<u>Attendance</u>	Cumulative Attendance 6/2009 through 5/2010	
		<u>Present</u>	<u>Absent</u>
Nolan Haan, Chair	P	2	0
Susan McClellan, Vice Chair	P	2	0
Jay Adams	A	0	2
Andy Cole	A	0	2
Beauregard Cummings	A	1	1
Joyce Gardner	P	1	1
Mary-Jane Graff	A	1	1
Marie Harrison	P	2	0
Daryl Jolly	P	1	1
Robert Prager	P	1	1

City Staff

Assistant City Attorney Carrie Sarver
Pat Garbe-Morillo, Planning and Zoning Department
Merrilyn Rathbun, Fort Lauderdale Historical Society, Consultant to HPB
J. Opperee, ProtoType Recording Secretary

Communication to the City Commission

- By voice vote, the Board authorized Chair Haan to re-draft the letter the Board had sent to the previous City Commission regarding Demolition by Neglect. The Board also requested that Chair Haan be put on a City Commission conference agenda to present the letter and the white paper the Board had previously authorized.

Index

	Case Number	Applicant	Page
1.	2-H-09 [SB]	Stephen Tilbrook, Dr. Kennedy Homes	2
2.	4-H- 09 [SB]	Nolan Haan	3
3.	7-H-09 [SB]	Andrew DeFeo	3
		For the Good of the City	7

Purpose: Implement the City's historic preservation regulations, which promote the cultural, economic, educational and general welfare of the people of the City and of the public generally through the preservation and protection of historically or architecturally worthy structures.

Call to Order

Mr. Haan called the meeting of the Historic Preservation Board to order at 5:05 p.m.

Approval of Minutes of June 2009 Meeting

Motion made by Ms. Gardner, seconded by Mr. Prager, to approve the minutes of the Board's June 2009 meeting. Board approved unanimously.

Board members disclosed communications they had regarding cases.

All members of the public wishing to address the Board on any item were sworn in.

I. Cases

[Index](#)

1. Applicant: Stephen Tilbrook, Dr. Kennedy Homes 2-H-09 (SB)

Owner: Housing Authority of the City of Fort Lauderdale

Request: ** Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition
▪ Demolition of forty-two (42) structures

Deferred from June Certificate of Appropriateness for Alteration
▪ Rehabilitation of three (3) structures

1, 2009 to July 6, 2009 Certificate of Appropriateness for New Construction
▪ Construct seven (7) new two to four (2-4) story buildings with a total of one hundred and fifty (150) residential units.

Legal Description Block 1 of the Dr. Kennedy Homes Project, PB 15, P 70.

Address: 1004 West Broward Blvd.

General Location: South side of W. Broward Blvd. between SW 11th and SW 9th Avenues

District: 4

Ms. Morillo stated the applicant was requesting deferral to the Board's September 14 meeting.

Mr. Steve Tilbrook, applicant, explained that they were still refining the proposal to provide some additional historic preservation, and requested a continuance the Board's September 14, 2009 meeting.

Mr. Haan asked if Mr. Tilbrook had received a copy of the Janus Group's historic study on the property. Mr. Tilbrook stated he had a draft and they hoped to submit it to the Broward County Historical Commission in the next two weeks. Mr. Haan asked that this document be submitted to the HPB as well.

Motion made by Ms. McClellan, seconded by Mr. Jolly, to defer this item to the Board's September 14, 2009 meeting. In a roll call vote, motion passed 6 - 0.

[Index](#)

2. Applicant: Nolan Haan

4 H 09 (SB)

Owner: Nolan Haan

Request: ** * Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition

- **To demolish a single family residence**

Legal Description: Bryant Subdivision. Block 22, Lot 14, PB 1, P. 29.

Address: 725 SW 2nd Court

General Location: Between SW 7th and 8th Avenues

District: 4

Mr. Haan recused himself, and without a quorum the case was automatically deferred to the Board's September 14 meeting.

3. Applicant: Andrew DeFeo

7-H-09 SB

Owner: Stephanie Patten

Request: Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition

- **Remove exterior staircase and landing**
- **Demolish one back yard shed**

Certificate of Appropriateness for Alteration

- **Two story addition and deck**
- **Installation of 16 (sixteen) double hung windows**
- **Installation of 2 (two) raised panel doors and one sliding door**

Legal Description: Waverly Place, Block 108, Lots 11 and 12. P.B. 2, P. 19.
Broward County.

Address: 304 SW 12 Avenue

District 4

Ms. Morillo stated this was a request for 2 Certificates of Appropriateness: One COA for Demolition of an exterior staircase and shed, and a second COA for Alteration, for a new addition with a deck and installation of new windows and doors.

Ms. Morillo advised the Board to consider whether the request met one or more of the three criteria for demolition listed in Section 47-24.11.C.4.c. i.-iii., as well as the General Criteria for a Certificate of Appropriateness as listed in Section 47-24.11. C.3.c.i. a. thru f. of the ULDR when considering whether to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition for this application. She noted that General criteria for a COA for Alteration included Section 47-24.11.C.3.c.1. a-f and the additional guidelines in Section 47-24.11.C.3.ii.a-h and iii a-j for alterations and new construction.

Ms. Rathbun reported the residence at 304 Southwest 12th Avenue appeared on the 1928 Sanborn Fire Insurance map and was considered a contributing property in the Sailboat Bend Historic District. The house was two stories with a simple gable roof with an exterior stair and second floor deck. A small shed was located to the rear of the house. She noted the shed did not appear on any of the Sanborn Maps and was considered non-contributing.

Ms. Rathbun stated the applicant was asking to demolish the non-contributing shed, the wood decks and stairs to allow for new construction.

Ms. Rathbun noted Criterion iii. below applied:

Section 47-24.11.C
4. Demolition
c. Criteria—Demolition

- i. The designated property no longer contributes to a Historic District
- ii. The property or building no longer has significance as a historic architectural or archeological landmark; or
- iii. The demolition or redevelopment project is of major benefit to a historic district

Ms. Rathbun stated that originally the house had been used as a duplex with separate living quarters on both floors. The owner now wished to use the house as a single-family residence. She intended to build a new addition on the south side of the house to provide space for the installation of an elevator for interior access to the second floor. The new two-story addition, with an inset entry porch, would be set back over twelve feet from the front of the historic structure. A second floor exterior wood deck with a stair would be built at the rear of the house. The original interior first floor would be reconfigured with two bedrooms, a bath and closet space.

The applicant had requested the following materials:

Sec. 47-17.7 Material and design guidelines

B. Materials and designs

1. Exterior building walls

a. Materials and finish

- ii. Wood – shiplap siding smooth face, four (4) inches to eight (8) inches to the weather.

Ms. Rathbun said the exterior wall cladding of the new addition would match the shiplap siding of the original structure.

2. Windows and doors

a. Materials

- i. glass (...non-reflective, tinted

b. Configurations

- ii. windows; rectangular

c. Operations

- i. windows; double hung; fixed with frame;

d. General

- i. shutters, non- operable
- vi. Screened windows

Ms. Rathbun added the roof of the new addition would be a simple gable with asphalt shingles to match the original structure.

3. Roofs and gutters

a. Roof materials

- vii. fiberglass and asphalt shingles

c. Configurations

- i. Roof: The pitch of new roofs may be matched to the pitch of the roof of existing structures on the lot. Simple gable and hip, pitch no less than 3:12 and no more than 8:12.

Ms. Rathbun stated the inset entry porch of the new addition would have a wood support column.

6. Arcades and porches
 - a. Material and finish
 - ii. Wood; posts and columns

Ms. Rathbun informed the Board that the requested materials met the Materials and Design guidelines for the SBHD. The new addition was necessary for the new use and would not impact the historic character of the house.

Mr. Andrew DeFeo, applicant, displayed photos of the house and pointed out the staircase, deck and shed they intended to remove. He explained that the existing laundry shed had foundation failure, requiring replacement.

Mr. DeFeo displayed a current site plan and photos of the interior demolition and exterior deck removal, and explained they would replace all of the existing windows. On the second floor, the kitchen and bath would be demolished.

Mr. DeFeo stated they were also requesting approval for a new two-story wood-frame addition to the side and back yards, including wooden stairs and a deck. The addition would also include a new elevator, breakfast nook and laundry room. Mr. DeFeo displayed a proposed site plan for the new addition, and stated the addition would protrude no farther than the existing wood deck. The stairs and deck would be relocated to the rear of the house. This would be done to preserve the oak tree on the property.

Mr. Haan opened the public hearing. There being no members of the public wishing to address this item, Mr. Haan closed the public hearing and brought the discussion back to the Board.

Ms. McClellan remarked that it was nice to see the owner convert the home back to single-family and noted that the proposed changes were an aesthetic improvement. Mr. Haan agreed that the addition would improve the look of the house.

Mr. Haan noted that per the Secretary of the Interior guidelines, the addition should be differentiated from the original structure. Mr. DeFeo stated the addition would not appear different from the original structure. Mr. Jolly pointed out that the addition would be stepped away from the original house, and this would differentiate it. Ms. Rathbun

said this idea had been discussed recently in the preservation movement, and some questioned whether the differentiation requirement should continue. Ms. Rathbun did not feel it must be strictly adhered to. She felt a bit of differentiation in the siding and windows would be appropriate for this project. Mr. Haan felt it would be most cost effective to use the same siding, and the applicant should not worry about the differentiation.

Motion made by Ms. McClellan, seconded by Mr. Prager, to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for demolition. In a roll call vote, motion passed 6 - 0.

Motion made by Ms. McClellan, seconded by Mr. Jolly, to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for alteration. In a roll call vote, motion passed 6 - 0.

III. For the Good of the City

[Index](#)

Election of Chair and Vice Chair

Ms. Morillo announced that Chair Susan Jordan had resigned, and the Board could vote to elect a new Chair.

Ms. McClellan nominated Mr. Haan as Chair, seconded by Mr. Prager. Board unanimously approved.

Mr. Haan nominated Ms. McClellan as Vice Chair, seconded by Mr. Prager. Board unanimously approved.

Communication to the City Commission

Chair Haan stated the Board had authorized him approximately one year ago to draft a letter to the City Commission regarding demolition by neglect. He had spoken to members of City staff regarding this, and Greg Brewton, Planning and Zoning Department Director, had informed him that there must be a City policy change for some of the Board's recommendations to be implemented.

Chair Haan asked the Board to authorize him to write another letter to the City Commission requesting that he make a presentation to them to keep the Board's recommendations moving. Chair Haan noted there was currently no language in the ULDR addressing Demolition by Neglect, and this was needed. He reminded the Board that he had the letter the Board had authorized him to send previously, which he could copy and address to the new City Commission. He could also send the white paper that the Board had already approved.

Motion made by Ms. McClellan, seconded by Mr. Prager, to authorize Chair Haan to re-draft the letter the Board had sent to the previous City Commission regarding Demolition by Neglect. The Board also requested that Chair Haan be put on a City Commission conference agenda to present the letter and the white paper the Board had previously authorized. In a roll call vote, motion passed 6 - 0.

There being no further business to come before the Board, the meeting was adjourned at 5:50 p.m.

Chairman

Nolan Haan, Chair

Attest:

ProtoTYPE Inc, Recording Secretary

The City of Fort Lauderdale maintains a Website for the Historic Preservation Board Meeting Agendas and Results: <http://ci.ftlaud.fl.us/documents/hpb/hpbagenda.htm>

Minutes prepared by: J. Opperlee, ProtoType Services