

**HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD
CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE
MONDAY, FEBRUARY 1, 2010 - 5:00 P.M.
CITY HALL FIRST FLOOR COMMISSION CHAMBER
100 NORTH ANDREWS AVENUE
FORT LAUDERDALE, FLORIDA**

<u>Board Members</u>	<u>Attendance</u>	Cumulative Attendance 6/2009 through 5/2010	
		<u>Present</u>	<u>Absent</u>
Nolan Haan, Chair	A	6	1
Susan McClellan, Vice Chair	P	7	0
Beauregard Cummings	P	5	2
Matthew DeFelice	P	2	0
Joyce Gardner	P	5	2
Marie Harrison	P	5	1
Daryl Jolly [5:19]	P	4	3
Robert Prager	A	5	2
Robert Rojas	P	5	0
Scott Strawbridge	P	2	0
Allen Wilkerson	A	0	1

City Staff

Assistant City Attorney Carrie Sarver
Pat Garbe-Morillo, Planning and Zoning Department
Merrilyn Rathbun, Fort Lauderdale Historical Society, Consultant to HPB
J. Opperlee, ProtoType Recording Secretary

Communication to the City Commission

None

Index

	Case Number	Applicant	Page	District
1.	6-H-09	Archie Shepp	<u>2</u>	3
2.	1-H-10 SB	Frank Snedaker	<u>4</u>	4
		For the Good of the City	<u>6</u>	

Purpose: Implement the City's historic preservation regulations, which promote the cultural, economic, educational and general welfare of the people of the City and of the public generally through the preservation and protection of historically or architecturally worthy structures.

Call to Order

Ms. McClellan called the meeting of the Historic Preservation Board to order at 5:00 p.m.

Board members disclosed communications they had regarding cases.

All members of the public wishing to address the Board on any item were sworn in.

Approval of Minutes of December 2009 Meeting

Motion made by Ms. Gardner, seconded by Ms. Harrison, to approve the minutes of the Board's December 2009 meeting. In a voice vote, Board approved unanimously.

I. Cases

[Index](#)

1. Case: 6-H-09

Applicant: Archie Shepp

Owner: Avis McSmith

Request: ** Historic Designation of Avis McSmith House and Kindergarten

Legal Description Dorsey Park Subdivision. Block 3, Lots 18 and 19, PB 19, P. 5, public records of Broward County, Fl.

Address: 611 NW 15th Avenue

General Location: North side of NW 6 St. between NW 15 Avenue and NW 15 Terrace

District: 3

Ms. Morillo stated this was a request for local historic designation status of the Avis McSmith House and Kindergarten. She advised the HPB to consider Section 47-24.11. B. 1 through 10 of the ULDR in addition to Criteria for Historic Designation in Section 47-24.11.B.6.c and f, when deciding whether to grant local landmark status.

Ms. Rathbun informed the Board that Avis McSmith graduated from Bethune Cookman College in 1937 where she had received teacher training. In about 1949 the McSmiths moved to the property just off Sistrunk Boulevard where Mr. McSmith built the house

and a school building for his wife. Ms. Rathbun explained that Mr. McSmith had physically built the house himself, using concrete molds borrowed from Reverend Larimore, who had built the St. Christopher Episcopal Church.

Avis McSmith then opened one of the first kindergarten and day care facilities to serve the Northwest section of Fort Lauderdale. Over the years many of the children taught by Mrs. McSmith grew up to become prominent members of the community such as Eugene Pettis and Raleigh Rawls, attorneys, and Greg Brewton, City of Fort Lauderdale Planning Director.

Section 47-24.11. Historic designation of landmarks, landmark site or buildings and certificate of appropriateness.

B. Historic designation.

6. Criteria. The criteria for the designation of property as a landmark, landmark site or historic district shall be based on one (1) or more of the following criteria:

c. Its identification with a person or persons who significantly contributed to the development of the city, state, or nation,

Ms. Rathbun informed the Board that the McSmith house was one of the earlier examples of post-war construction in the Northwest community. The Avis McSmith house and school were substantial post-war modern CBS structures.

Ms. Rathbun described the house as L-shaped with a hip roof, an enclosed flat roofed entry porch and a hipped roofed attached garage. The house also had a decorative Deco style vent on the north wall of the garage. The school building had a flat roof with overhanging eaves. Ms. Rathbun noted that the school building was no longer in use and the windows were boarded up.

f. Its distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style valuable for the study of a period, method of construction, or use of indigenous materials,

Ms. Rathbun stated the Avis McSmith House and School were worthy of local designation under the two criteria cited above.

Ms. McClellan opened the public hearing.

Ms. Annie Lewis, Ms. McSmith's caretaker, stated Ms. McSmith had started the first school for black children in the community.

Mr. Ralph Johnson, professor of Architecture at FAU School of Architecture and Director of the FAU Center for the Conservation of Architectural and Cultural Heritage, said his mission was to talk about legacy communities, of which Fort Lauderdale was

one. He said they could begin with this structure to preserve the memory of this African American community in Fort Lauderdale. He asked the Board to vote in favor of designation for this property.

Mr. Strawbridge agreed it was an interesting site, and asked Mr. Johnson if the architecture was also important. Mr. Johnson explained that the architecture was “vernacular” which meant it did not belong to an identifiable style, but it was “of a place, of a people, of a culture that built it” and as such, was significant.

Ms. Morillo read an email from Alyssa Plummer, Vice President of the Trust for Historic Sailboat Bend, indicating her support for designation.

There being no other members of the public wishing to address this item, Ms. McClellan closed the public hearing and brought the discussion back to the Board.

Mr. Jolly arrived at 5:19.

Ms. Morillo explained to Mr. Strawbridge that Archie Shepp was Ms. McSmith’s grandnephew and had power of attorney for her.

Mr. Cummings stated there were a couple of other nursery facilities prior to Ms. McSmith’s, but hers was the first nursery structure.

Mr. Strawbridge was planning a neighborhood cleanup effort in Durrs and Home Beautiful, and said he would be glad to make sure that someone kept an eye on the property, and offered to paint it as well. Ms. Morillo agreed to communicate this to Mr. Shepp and to send him a copy of the minutes.

Motion made by Ms. Gardner, seconded by Mr. Cummings, to approve the application for local historic designation as presented. In a roll call vote, motion passed 8 – 0.

[Index](#)

2. Case: 1-H-10 SB

Applicant: Frank Snedaker

Owner: City of Fort Lauderdale

Request: ** Certificate of Appropriateness for Alteration

- Installation of 455 linear feet galvanized steel fence
- Installation of Wood Gazebo and Playground

Legal Description Riverland Highlands, Block 4, Lots 1 through 10, and Block 3, Lots 1 through 7, PB 10, P.3. Together with that portion of right of way for “Melrose Court”, (Southwest 2nd Ct.); and also together with that portion of the right of way lying east of the

centerline of "Kenilworth Place". (southwest 14 Way), PB
39084, P. 1712, of Broward County.

Address: 1401 SW 2nd Court

General Location: West side of SW 14 Ave., between SE 14 Way and Canal

District: 4

Ms. Morillo stated this was a request for two Certificates of Appropriateness 1) for Alteration to install a fence and a 2) for New Construction of a gazebo and playground set. She advised the Board to consider the SBHD Material and Design Guidelines indicated in Section 47-17.7. of the ULDR, the General criteria for a COA in Section 47-24.11.C.3.c.i. a through f, as well as the Additional criteria for alterations and new construction in Section 47-24.11.C.3.c.ii when deciding whether to grant a COA for Alteration and New Construction.

Ms. Rathbun informed the Board that the applicant was requesting approval of a new gazebo, a playground and a four-foot high fence for a new City park preserve. The gazebo was octagonal with a hip roof, wood shingle roof cladding, a small cupola and exposed rafters.

Ms. Rathbun explained that the applicant was requesting approval of a galvanized metal fence to be painted black. The playground and the gazebo would be erected along the vacated street, Southwest 2nd Court, some distance from the fence, which would be erected along the perimeter of the park. The applicant had provided a photograph of a similar playground structure.

Ms. Rathbun said the City Landscape Department has suggested that a rustic split rail wood fence be installed to complement the playground; she agreed this was an appropriate style and it could be configured to avoid removing any plant material.

Section 47-17.7 Material and design guidelines

B. Materials and designs

3. Roofs and gutters

a. Roof materials

iii. Cedar shingles.

c. Configurations

Roof: The pitch of new roofs may be matched to the pitch of the roof of existing structures on the lot.

Simple gable and hip, pitch no less than 3:12 and no more than 8:12. Rafters in overhangs to be exposed.

5. Garden walls and fences.

a. Materials and style

v. Other galvanized steel, painted black

Ms. Rathbun stated the requested materials met the design guidelines of the SBHD.

Ms. McClellan opened the public hearing.

Mr. Frank Snedaker, City Architect, explained that the original gazebo they had planned to use could not meet code, and he presented a photo of a steel gazebo that could pass code that they could use instead.

Mr. Snedaker pointed out on the plan where the elements would be located on the property. Tom White, City Landscape Architect, explained that there would be some vegetation added to the site and the preserve area would not be touched.

Mr. DeFelice believed this was an archeologically sensitive area, and Mr. Snedaker stated they had performed an archeological survey that had resulted in no recommendation for an extensive search. Ms. Morillo stated there was a copy of the survey in the file.

There being no other members of the public wishing to address this item, Ms. McClellan closed the public hearing and brought the discussion back to the Board.

Mr. Snedaker asked the Board to choose between the two fence styles he had submitted: the black iron and the wood split rail. Mr. Strawbridge suggested the split rail was more appropriate and would save money and Ms. McClellan agreed. Mr. Rojas noted the wood fence would be kinder to wildlife as well.

Motion made by Mr. Strawbridge, seconded by Ms. Gardner, to approve the application, with the specified steel gazebo and the wood split-rail fence. In a roll call vote, motion passed 8-0.

II. For the Good of the City

[Index](#)

Ms. Sarver distributed a rough draft of proposed changes to the ordinance created by staff. She explained they anticipated making the changes in two or three waves rather than all at once.

Ms. Sarver promised to email the drafts to all Board members regarding Sections 47-17 and 47-24.11. Ms. Sarver listed a couple of items they were amending, and asked Board members to review the documents and forward their comments to her. Her office would compile the comments and submit them to the City Commission. She advised that there would also be the opportunity to further amend the ordinance when the City Commission heard the ordinance amendments at public hearing.

III. Communication to the City Commission

None

There being no further business to come before the Board, the meeting was adjourned at 5:50 p.m.

Chairman,

Nolan Haan, Chair

Attest:

ProtoType Inc, Recording Secretary

The City of Fort Lauderdale maintains a Website for the Historic Preservation Board Meeting Agendas and Results: <http://ci.ftlaud.fl.us/documents/hpb/hpbagenda.htm>

Minutes prepared by: J. Opperlee, ProtoType Services