

**CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE
SUSTAINABILITY ADVISORY BOARD
CITY HALL CITY COMMISSION CHAMBERS – 1ST FLOOR
100 NORTH ANDREWS AVENUE
FORT LAUDERDALE, FLORIDA
JUNE 27, 2011 – 6:30 P.M.**

Members	Attendance	Cumulative Attendance 1/2011 through 12/2011	
		Present	Absent
Jon Albee, Chair	P	6	0
Alena Alberani, Vice Chair	P	5	1
Anthony Abbate	P	6	0
Jaime Castoro	P	5	1
Cathy Curry [6:40]	P	1	0
Vicki Eckels	P	6	0
William Goetz	A	5	1
Dana Pollitt	A	3	2
Rebecca J. Walter	P	5	1

Also Present

Todd Hiteshew, Staff Liaison, Environmental Services Manager
 Lee Feldman, City Manager
 Albert Carbon, Public Works Director
 Barbara Hartmann, Recording Secretary, ProtoType, Inc.

Communications to the City Commission

Motion made by Ms. Eckels, seconded by Ms. Alberani to inform the City Commission that the Board supports the Wind Turbine proposal at the Hilton Hotel on Fort Lauderdale Beach. In a roll call vote, motion passed 7-0.

1. Call to Order

The meeting was called to order at 6:30 p.m. by Chair Albee.

2. Roll call – Introductions

Roll was called and it was determined a quorum was present.

3. Mr. Lee R. Feldman, ICMA-CM – City Manager

[This item was heard out of order]

Mr. Feldman arrived at 6:33.

Board members introduced themselves to Mr. Feldman.

Ms. Eckels asked Mr. Feldman to expound on how measuring for outcomes and quality assurance fit into his plans. Mr. Feldman stated the City must concentrate on its five core services: infrastructure, public places, neighborhood enhancement, business development and public safety. He said he would be organizing the City with two Assistant City Managers; one would focus on the operational aspects and one would focus on the support aspects. He would also bring on an individual who would handle performance measurements and processing Citywide. Mr. Feldman said they must learn to work faster, smarter and cheaper.

Regarding sustainability, Mr. Feldman said they had adopted a policy in Palm Bay of measuring things by a triple bottom line: people, planet and profit or environment, economics and equity. Mr. Feldman reported the City had just completed its first LEED Gold certified building at Executive Airport. He felt they could also change the way they did business, such as switching to paperless agendas and moving to duplex printing.

Ms. Eckels said she was looking forward to coordinating and determining a process they could all use to work together. She recalled the Board had discussed the need for more grant writers, an area in which the City had been understaffed. Mr. Feldman said he did not know whether or not they had the staff for grant writing, but he pointed out that State and Federal grants were being phased out and they must focus on private foundation grants, which required a different type of grant writing skill. They must also network and form partnerships. Mr. Feldman said there were other outreach efforts he would engage in through his professional associations and contacts, such as the ICMA and ICLEI.

Regarding advocacy, Mr. Feldman remarked that Mayor Seiler was integrated in the State Legislature, having served there for eight years. The City also had State lobbyists and was a member of the Florida League of Cities. At the federal level, they had a very strong delegation in the House of Representatives and had access to their State senators as well. Mr. Feldman felt the real effort on behalf of the City would be with agencies: Housing and Urban Development [HUD], the Department of Energy and the Department of Transportation.

Chair Albee noted that the term "social equity" had become an issue for the Board, and asked Mr. Feldman his concept of social equity. Mr. Feldman said they must consider the implications of every decision on all neighborhoods. He provided the example of LED light bulbs, which were very expensive and not affordable to every resident. Mr. Feldman described the Neighborhood Stabilization Program [NSP], in which HUD provided money to the City to retrofit foreclosed home to resell, usually in lower income neighborhoods. In Palm Bay, Mr. Feldman said they also made the refurbished homes Green. Ms. Eckels stated the Fort Lauderdale NSP program had not included any sustainable features. This indicated to her that the City's culture must change so employees questioned whether every action was sustainable or if there was a more

sustainable way to perform the action. Mr. Feldman remarked that organizations did not change quickly or easily, and forcing change too quickly could result in resentment and pushback.

Chair Albee asked Mr. Feldman how the Board could work with him to accomplish their goals. Mr. Feldman said it would be a partnership, and the Board should communicate with his office. Ms. Eckels explained the frustration the Board had experienced with the multi-family recycling program and said the City did not seem to be taking even simple steps, and she hoped this would change. Mr. Feldman said he tried to focus on the lessons of high-performing organizations to bring to the City. He stated he would welcome communications from the Board.

4. New Member Introduction

Cathy Curry

Ms. Curry arrived at 6:40.

5. Approval of Meeting Minutes – April 2011

Motion made by Ms. Eckels, seconded by Ms. Castoro, to approve the Board's May minutes as presented. In a voice vote, Board unanimously approved.

6. Staff Liaison Report

- EECBG

Mr. Hiteshew reported the EECBC rebate program was going well, as were the Energy Saver Workshops.

- Other items

Mr. Hiteshew reported regarding the ISO 50001 Program, he had emailed Dr. Robert Farmer with an open invitation to address the Board.

- Action Items

Ms. Eckels asked if Mr. Hiteshew had asked about the remaining funding for Ms. Naigur, the Energy Manager. Mr. Hiteshew said Ms. Naigur should attend tonight's meeting, and she was willing to attend as many meetings as possible. Mr. Hiteshew said Ms. Naigur's primary task was the Sustainability Action Plan, Version II and she would speak about the energy conservation measures taken in City operations.

7. New Business

- Wind Turbines: Hilton Hotel on Fort Lauderdale Beach

Heidi Davis Knapik, attorney with the Gunster Law Firm said the hotel owners, Costa Dorado, were "very passionate" about sustainability and renewable resources and had developed sustainable strategies as part of the Hilton on the beach and wind turbines were part of their plan. Ms. Knapik explained that the City did not have regulations regarding wind turbines and they had applied to the Board of Adjustment for a variance

to the mechanical equipment requirements. The Board of Adjustment had asked the City Commission for direction and deferred the Hilton's application until July. The City Commission had referred the applicant to the Utility Advisory Board, who recommended approval in the commercial setting. The City Commission had then asked the applicant to visit the Sustainability Advisory Committee. Ms. Knapik said City staff was now working on policy and regulations regarding wind turbines.

Ms. Eckels asked if the blades would be removed in very high winds. Mr. Jiro Yates said they hoped to install models that could be folded down if necessary. He added that these units were rated for 145 mph winds. Mr. Yates explained to Mr. Abbate that the six units would generate a total of 32 kilowatts.

Motion made by Ms. Eckels, seconded by Ms. Alberani to inform the City Commission that the Board supports the Wind Turbine proposal at the Hilton Hotel on Fort Lauderdale Beach.

Ms. Ann Wiley, resident, was concerned about the effect the wind turbines could have on migratory birds. Mr. Yates explained that the avian mortality rates were associated with large, horizontal axis wind farms; he could find no cases of avian death associated with a vertical axis wind turbine.

Ms. Curry stated she needed to become more educated about this item before she could support this request.

In a roll call vote, **motion** passed 7-0.

- Carbon Solutions America – Update

Ms. Naigur gave a Power Point presentation, a copy of which is attached to these minutes for the public record.

In the grant review section, Ms. Naigur stated they had reviewed the bid and supplied case studies regarding fuel-efficient vehicles for the recycling collection services. Ms. Eckels said this was a great idea that had not been adopted; the RFP had not contained any criteria for fuel-efficient vehicles, it was based on low bid. Mr. Hiteshew admitted the recommendation did not fit with the procurement code and purchasing guidelines for the RFP, which were based on low bid. Ms. Naigur said the SAP update would include leadership and administration, and one proposed action item would be environmentally preferred purchasing. She said there should be an overhaul of bidding procedures to take sustainability into consideration.

Ms. Naigur explained the Carbon Disclosure Project was an international platform to report greenhouse gas emissions. Cities were publishing their own reports, which were available to the public on the website: www.cdproject.net

Ms. Naigur said she hoped to have the consolidation report within the next two weeks and would provide the Board an update at their next meeting. She anticipated a final draft by August that could be finalized by September.

- “Where are California’s Green Jobs?” – Bill Goetz

Dr. Goetz was not present so the Board agreed to defer this item to their next meeting.

- FPL – Jon Albee

Chair Albee was unsure if this was within the Board’s purview, but an individual Board member could choose to pursue it. The subject had come up because Mr. Abbate had informed the Board that FPL was one of the biggest polluters in the area. Ms. Eckels felt the Board should pursue this, and felt they should contact the County’s Climate Change Task Force.

Motion made by Ms. Eckels, seconded by Ms. Castoro, for the Board to pursue this issue. In a voice vote, Board unanimously approved.

Mr. Hiteshew agreed to contact the City’s FPL liaison.

8. Old Business

None.

9. Communications to the City Commission

Motion made by Ms. Castoro, seconded by Ms. Walter, to forward the Board’s motion regarding the Hilton’s wind turbine to the City Commission. In a voice vote, Board unanimously approved.

10. Public Comment

- Kurt Morrow – Green Business League, Inc.

Mr. Morrow was not present.

- Mark Lopez – Sea Turtle Oversight Protection

Ms. Ann Wiley, Sea Turtle Oversight Protection, had provided the Board copies of a letter she had received from the Code Enforcement Department, as well as a copy of the City’s lighting ordinance that had been adopted in 2003.

Ms. Wiley stated people who were on the beach at night witnessed the heartache that was directly caused by the “lethal and illegal lighting along our coast.” She said Fort Lauderdale was horrible regarding lighting and there were many coastal municipalities that had very successful lighting regulations.

Ms. Wiley related the story of how Sea Turtle Oversight Protection had begun with the Whitecloud family voluntarily protecting one sea turtle nest. Ms. Wiley said they had

asked why the lighting was so bad, and she had received a response from Mike Maloney, Code Enforcement Manager. Mr. Maloney had explained his theory regarding enforcement of the City's lighting ordinance. He said the City's approach to enforcement had been "educational rather than heavy handed" and their goal was to "increase compliance through education rather than talking a punitive approach of imposing fines."

Ms. Wiley remarked that a Code Enforcement Officer's job was to enforce the code, and this was a simple issue that had been made complex. If Code Enforcement Officers did their work, the City could move through this problem. She stated Boca Raton had excellent lighting compliance.

Ms. Wiley said Sea Turtle Oversight Protection stayed on the beach all night, every night, covering as many nests as they could. Last year, they had covered 28% of the nests and discovered a 35% disorientation rate.

Ms. Wiley said Mr. Malone had also indicated that code inspectors continued to look for "innovative ways to reduce beach lighting." She pointed out that this was already well known and was accomplished by other municipalities. Ms. Wiley said Palm Beach County beach residents received a "Dark Skies" flyer every March but Broward County residents did not.

Ms. Eckels asked if the ordinance was sufficient, and Mr. Richard Whitecloud, Sea Turtle Oversight Protection, said the terminology "no lighting visible from the beach" was interpreted differently. He explained that the coastal development protocol and an economic business model that promoted consumerism was not sustainable because consumerism was taking more than 50% of the share of the economic resource. He said instead of considering the beach an economic resource, it should be referred to as an Eco-nomic resource. Mr. Whitecloud stated this was the second largest turtle nesting habitat in the world, so it was their responsibility to preserve it. Ms. Eckels said it was time to enforce this ordinance.

Mr. Whitecloud explained that most of the urban infrastructure lighting that taxpayers paid for was energized by FPL at a bulk unit rate. If they could reduce the foot candle ratio to what was required, they would reduce energy use, increase sustainability, and reduce the carbon exhaust from the FPL plant.

Ms. Eckels recalled that in 2009, the City Commission had approved a grant for turtle lighting on the beach, and asked Mr. Hiteshew to find out what had happened to the grant money.

Ms. Wiley said in order to comply, people must close blinds, turn off outside lights, shield them completely and change the bulbs. Mr. Whitecloud said they must also "look

at the administrative procedures and how things were conducted in order to make sure that we're honestly getting our full representation."

Ms. Wiley said they would like to see the Board and the City Manager ask the City Commission to mandate enforcement of the lighting code and to include Fort Lauderdale's Beach in their Master Plan for Sustainability and designate it as an endangered species habitat.

Mr. Whitecloud described a lighting retro-fit project in Deerfield Beach that had cost \$500 but cut the electric bill from \$700 per month to \$250 per month. Turtles were now nesting at the location, increasing the eco-tourism aspect of the property. Mr. Whitecloud stated their biggest challenge was the tourism industry; they must understand that this was an economic resource that was worth billions of dollars every year to Fort Lauderdale. He wanted to convince the Board to help them change the business model of the beach because it was not a beach, it was an endangered nesting habitat and a true environmental asset. Mr. Whitecloud offered to return to the Board to give his complete lighting presentation.

Mr. Abbate wanted to look into why Code Enforcement was not enforcing the Code. He felt the beach, as part of the natural environment, should be part of the Board's Sustainability report. Mr. Abbate noted that the natural environment brought people to Florida. He said they should address the Dark Sky concept as well. Chair Albee said the City was considering the beach redevelopment process and this could be incorporated in it.

Mr. Hiteshew remarked that there was a lot of competition for resources at Code Enforcement and it was challenging to get the resources out at night. He suggested Code Enforcement could address the Board in July to discuss their action plan regarding beach lighting.

Mr. Whitecloud said the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service, the Fish and Wildlife Commission and the Department of Environmental Protection had already educated Code Enforcement. He stated Sea Turtle Oversight Protection had a database on lighting infractions and turtle disorientation percentages that they constantly shared with Code Enforcement.

Motion made by Ms. Eckels, seconded by Ms. Alberani, to include the beach habitat in the Sustainability Action Plan. In a voice vote, Board unanimously approved.

Motion made by Mr. Abbate, seconded by Ms. Alberani, for the City to set the Dark Sky Initiative as a goal. In a voice vote, Board unanimously approved.

Mr. Whitecloud informed the Board that Lauderdale-By-The-Sea had gone from almost 100% non-compliant to almost 90% compliant within a six month period.

11. Adjournment

With no further business to come before the Board at this time, the meeting was adjourned at 8:45 p.m.

Next meeting date: July 25, 2011

Attachments:

Minutes – May 2011

[Minutes prepared by J. Opperlee, Prototype, Inc.]