

**CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE
SUSTAINABILITY ADVISORY BOARD
CITY HALL CITY COMMISSION CHAMBERS – 1ST FLOOR
100 NORTH ANDREWS AVENUE
FORT LAUDERDALE, FLORIDA
NOVEMBER 28, 2011 – 6:30 P.M.**

Members	Attendance	Cumulative Attendance 1/2011 through 12/2011	
		Present	Absent
Jon Albee, Chair	P	10	1
Alena Alberani, Vice Chair	P	9	2
Anthony Abbate	P	10	1
Valerie Amor	P	5	0
Jaime Castoro	P	10	1
Cathy Curry	P	6	0
Vicki Eckels	P	11	0
William Goetz [arrived 6:44]	P	10	1
Dana Pollitt	P	7	3
Rebecca J. Walter	A	8	3

Also Present

Todd Hiteshew, Staff Liaison
 Matt Zirkelbach, Vice President of Carbon Solutions America
 Barry Heimlich, FAU Research Affiliate
 D'Wayne Spence, Assistant City Attorney
 Randall Robinson, Planner II, Department of Sustainable Development
 Amanda Lebofsky, Recording Secretary, ProtoType, Inc.

Communications to the City Commission

Motion made by Dr. Goetz, seconded by Ms. Eckels, to ask the City Commission to direct staff to present the proposed urban agriculture and community gardens ordinance (presented under New Business) to the Sustainability Advisory Board before it is presented to the Planning & Zoning Board. In a voice vote, motion passed unanimously.

Motion made by Ms. Eckels, seconded by Ms. Castoro, to recommend the City Commission pass the attached FPL resolution (repeal of early cost recovery statute relating to electric utility charges). In a voice vote, motion passed 8-1 with Mr. Pollitt opposed.

1. Call to Order

The meeting was called to order at 6:30 p.m. by Chair Albee.

2. Roll call – Introductions

Roll was called and it was determined a quorum was present.

3. Approval of Meeting Minutes – October 2011

The Board noted corrections to the minutes.

By consensus, the Board approved the minutes as amended.

4. New Business

- Sea Level Rise Presentation – Barry Heimlich, FAU

Mr. Heimlich gave a Power Point presentation, a copy of which is attached to these minutes for the public record.

Ms. Amor asked if it was possible to break water storage into multiple local locations. Mr. Heimlich said they needed to put creative thought into this problem and ideas must be subjected to detailed study.

Dr. Goetz asked if there had been studies to determine the cost of doing nothing. Mr. Heimlich said the Organization for Economic Development in London had released a study describing which cities in the world were most susceptible to sea level rise, The study found Miami was the most vulnerable city in terms of economic assets at risk and the fourth most vulnerable in terms of population at risk. Mr. Heimlich stated there may be areas that would be selectively abandoned at the end of the century if the scenarios occurred.

Ms. Alberani noted that on the west coast, they were raising roadway levels and asked if this was being considered on the east coast. Mr. Heimlich said the entire southeast had been built using the roads as the drainage system. He said the Department of Transportation was studying the effects of these impacts.

Dr. Goetz felt the economic consequences of inaction must be part of the information provided to the community. Mr. Heimlich agreed, and noted that significant resources were needed to study this and develop alternatives. He said they must change the way energy was produced and used in order to moderate the situation. Dr. Goetz stated they must also concentrate on being more adaptive and resilient. He believed there must be some places that had already taken steps to mitigate sea level rise. Mr. Heimlich pointed out that South Florida was the most vulnerable place in the United States. He informed the Board that the Climate Change Task Force and the Regional Climate Compact among the four counties was the first of its kind in the U.S. and was being discussed as a model. Mr. Heimlich said he would provide the Board with a set of online links to some of the things to which he referred.

Mr. Abbate stated the Board was charged with advising the City Commission on issues related to sustainability. He asked Mr. Heimlich what issue he felt should be the Board's priority. Mr. Heimlich said the study's key finding had been that within the next few decades, a few inches of sea level rise would have a dramatic effect on the storm water drainage system in the region. This could increase damage in the interior due to rainfall. He advised that it took decades to do the planning and engineering and find the funding to make such infrastructure changes.

Anthony Olivieri, food policy advocate, explained that New York City had created a Green Infrastructure plan for storm water management and determined that it could save \$1.5 billion by implementing Green infrastructure. He suggested the Board examine this plan for ideas.

Mr. Heimlich remarked that the City of Gainesville Florida had initiated a "feed-in tariff" that resulted in a large number of solar panels being utilized in that city.

Joe Holland, resident and former Board member, said the City Commission's response to this issue had been to reactivate an old Public Works effort to install flap check valves on storm outlets to stop the spring tides from flooding certain streets. He noted that the wealthiest of neighborhoods had been the first to benefit from this, despite the fact that those neighborhoods had been willing to cover the costs themselves. Mr. Holland asked if this type of decision making had spread to Miami Dade County. Mr. Heimlich said there were significant funding limitations right now. Mr. Holland said he wanted neighborhoods that were able to do so to fund their own improvements.

- Urban Agriculture – Randall Robinson, Planner II

Mr. Robinson said they had been working on an urban agriculture ordinance and had developed a discussion item the City Commission had discussed a few weeks ago. Items they wanted in the ordinance included: urban farming, community gardens, animal keeping and green markets. Mr. Robinson said they had discovered that the City code already permitted bee keeping. The Commission had directed them to move forward with the urban farming and community gardens sections. They planned to bring the draft ordinance to the Planning and Zoning Board (P&Z) on December 21 and to the City Commission early next year.

Ms. Eckels asked if the Board could comment on the ordinance before it was presented to the Commission. Mr. Randall said this would be possible at the P&Z meeting on December 21.

Chair Albee thought the SAB should have a lot to say about what was in the ordinance before it was presented to the P&Z. He said this concerned the urbanization of agriculture, a sustainable activity, and the SAB was far more focused on sustainability than the P&Z.

Mr. Spence explained that this ordinance was reviewed by P&Z because it concerned land use. Mr. Abbate asked if there was a mechanism for bringing items to the SAB that concerned sustainability. Mr. Spence thought the City Commission wished the SAB to play a greater role, but was unsure if they understood everything this encompassed and suggested the Board communicate this to the Commission. Dr. Goetz suggested Mr. Randall take the initiative to keep the Board involved in this process. Mr. Abbate felt the Board should formally request that they review the ordinance before it was reviewed by P&Z.

Ms. Amor said the elements of urban farming, community gardens and animal keeping worked together. She said there was recommended language in the ordinance the P&Z might reject, and they had missed a key argument for why they would want urban farming in the middle of a residential area. Ms. Amor said this discussion needed to be addressed as a whole.

Motion made by Dr. Goetz, seconded by Ms. Eckels to request that the urban agriculture and community gardens ordinance be presented to the SAB before it was presented to the P&Z and the City Commission, even if this resulted in a delay of the ordinance's presentation to the P&Z and City Commission. In a voice vote, motion passed unanimously.

Mr. Randall suggested the Board could start addressing the policy issues, not the zoning issues.

Michael Madfis, food policy advocate, said he supported the idea that the SAB should review this first, and added that the ordinance should be as simple as possible to get it in place and follow up with the details.

Mr. Randall explained that the ordinance allowed community gardens on public land; community gardens were already permitted on park land, but the Parks Department had stated land was at a premium in parks and they would prefer community gardens not be an element there.

Motion made by Ms. Eckels, seconded by Dr. Goetz to request a change in the process to automatically engage the SAB in processes concerning sustainability, such as the urban agriculture and community gardens ordinance.

Mr. Randall said the Commission had brought up bringing this to the SAB.

Dr. Goetz stated they did not necessarily need to go through the Commission; there were memos of understanding that could be created between staff and the Board to facilitate the conveyance of information. He suggested they speak with Assistant City Manager Torriente about this first.

Ms. Eckels withdrew her motion and requested that Mr. Hiteshew discuss the Board's wish to participate more proactively and to establish a process to automatically engage the Commission. Mr. Hiteshew agreed. Chair Albee suggested they invite Ms. Torriente to attend their January meeting to discuss this.

Mr. Abbate remarked that there was a lack of administrative code discussing how the City operated vis a vis its boards. Mr. Spence thought the re-write of the ordinance would address some issues, but the question of how the Board interacted with staff and what type of items were brought to the Board had not been fleshed out and this was something that should be determined by the City Commission. He felt Ms. Torriente should be part of this discussion. Mr. Abbate reiterated that administrative code was needed to address these procedures.

Chair Albee suggested that the Department of Sustainable Development should pull the ordinance from the P&Z agenda until the SAB could review it. The Board would therefore not need to send a Communication to the City Commission. Ms. Eckels felt they should do both.

Mr. Goetz re-worded his previous motion:

Motion made by Dr. Goetz, seconded by Ms. Eckels, to ask the City Commission to direct staff to present the proposed urban agriculture and community gardens ordinance (presented under New Business) to the Sustainability Advisory Board before it is presented to the Planning & Zoning Board. In a voice vote, motion passed unanimously.

- IBM Grant – Bill Goetz

Dr. Goetz withdrew this item.

- Hazard Awareness Risk Mitigation (Risks, resilience, and mitigation) – Bill Goetz

Dr. Goetz withdrew this item.

5. Old Business

- 'Green' Awards – Jamie Castoro

Ms. Castoro had met with the Community Appearance Board (CAB), who indicated they would welcome the SAB's input for sustainability awards. Specifically, they wanted to present an award to TD Bank on Cypress Creek Road. Their only concern was the cost of the plaques. Ms. Amor suggested they use recycled materials to create the plaques. Ms. Eckels stated all of the awards should be of recycled materials. Mr. Abbate suggested showing the CAB photos of plaques made from recycled materials. Ms. Castoro stated the CAB wished the SAB to create the criteria for the award. Mr. Abbate agreed to create a list of criteria.

- FPL Resolution – Valerie Amor

Ms. Amor stated Pinecrest had passed an ordinance and there were two bills pending that would appeal the sections of Florida Statute that allowed FPL to keep recovering funding whether or not the power plants were ever built. Ms. Amor had contacted the authors of the bills and asked to be kept apprised of their progress. Ms. Amor said she did not want to encourage FPL to build nuclear power plants, and had added language stressing that renewable sources of energy should be pursued. Ms. Eckels asked if they should indicate specifically that they did not support nuclear power. Ms. Amor said they should state both: that they did not want FPL to collect fees for something they might not actually accomplish, and that they did not want FPL to build nuclear power plants. Ms. Eckels wanted to stress that local sustainable energy sources should be expanded, not just that there should be no nuclear expansion.

Mr. Hiteshew requested background on the resolution and the purpose it would serve. Mr. Spence agreed, and noted that such resolutions had been delayed in the past when background information was not provided.

Ms. Amor agreed to provide the resolution to Mr. Hiteshew.

Motion made by Ms. Eckels, seconded by Ms. Castoro, to recommend the City Commission pass the attached FPL resolution (repeal of early cost recovery statute relating to electric utility charges). In a voice vote, motion passed 8-1 with Mr. Pollitt opposed.

- Dark Sky Ordinance

Chair Albee said there was information that applied to what they wanted to accomplish with their lighting ordinance.

- Computerized Data Bank – Bill Goetz

Dr. Goetz recalled that the Board had asked the City to create a sustainability database that the City Attorney had denied. He noted that since then, some City boards had created Facebook and Twitter accounts that were even more conducive to cross communication between board members than a database. Dr. Goetz suggested the Board request the City Commission initiate a mass storage system, assuming it was also consistent with Sunshine Statutes, for storing information relevant to the SAB and the City's sustainability programs and initiatives, and that this databank be available to all SAB members and staff for the purposes of uploading and downloading information.

Mr. Spence said the City Attorney's office did not approve of any of the website activity Dr. Goetz had mentioned. He stated the advice from the City Attorney's office remained the same, and cautioned Board members about possible Sunshine issues.

Mr. Hiteshew said the City was working on a web portal for sharing information. He said there were issues regarding use of a City server. Mr. Hiteshew agreed to bring this up

again with the IT Director. Dr. Goetz wanted this to be discussed with the Board. Ms. Eckels suggested including Dr. Goetz in discussions with the IT Director.

- SAP Methodology – Bill Goetz

Dr. Goetz stated he had very strong objections to the way Ms. Naigur had ranked the Board's sustainability initiatives. He suggested the Board could forward an addendum to the SAP indicating that they did not endorse the SAP as the sole method. Ms. Eckels said she would be interested to find out if Dr. Goetz's suggestions had been considered by Ms. Naigur and/or Ms. Torriente. Dr. Goetz said he had discussed this with Ms. Torriente but she "didn't commit to anything one way or another, so I don't think she was really that familiar with it or necessarily willing to accept what I gave her..."

Mr. Hiteshew pointed out that this was a starting talking point. He said in 2012, they may decide to re-rank the priorities. Mr. Hiteshew said at least now they had a starting point to inform the City Manager's strategic planning process.

Ms. Amor stated Carbon Solutions had done a similar report for another city and had done it exactly the same way and tried to bypass that city's sustainability board. The report had been pulled back and discussed. She noted that city's board had expressed the same issues the SAB had. Dr. Goetz stated Ms. Naigur had made such basic mistakes in the updated SAP prioritization methodology, that he wondered if she had made mistakes with the greenhouse gas emissions report.

Chair Albee said the Commission had asked the SAB to rank their priorities and "to me it was just off the track." He felt this was a valuable lesson for the Board to learn, and it was important for them to establish priorities and protocols for the Board, to avoid being "handled" again.

Mr. Hiteshew suggested the Board could create the 2012 SAP update.

Dr. Goetz wanted to go on record regarding his objections to the prioritization methodology.

Chair Albee suggested the Board consider how to learn from their experiences in this first year.

- Budgeting for Outcomes – Bill Goetz

Dr. Goetz withdrew this item.

6. Staff Liaison Report

- Sustainability Advisory Board Ordinance

Mr. Hiteshew stated the first reading had been on November 1st and the second had been on the 21st.

- December Meeting

Mr. Hiteshew said there would be no December meeting.

Dr. Goetz wanted to meet in December. The Board discussed this and agreed not to meet in December.

- Sustainability Action Plan

Already discussed.

- January Meeting

Mr. Hiteshew said they would elect a Chair and Vice Chair on January 23.

Other discussion Items

Ms. Eckels advised Board members to contact their appointing commissioners to let them know they wished to be re-appointed.

Ms. Eckels had sent out a link regarding water fluoridation. Mr. Hiteshew explained there was a County ordinance requiring all public water supplies to be fluoridated. Ms. Eckels wanted the City Commission to request an exemption from the County. She asked that this be put on the Board's agenda. Ms. Eckels wanted to know the cost of adding fluoride to the water. Mr. Hiteshew agreed to find this information. Dr. Goetz remarked that fluoride was not intrinsically a poison; its toxicity depended on how much one consumed.

7. Communications to the City Commission

[This item was discussed out of order]

Motion made by Ms. Eckels, seconded by Mr. Abbate, to send Dr. Goetz's motion regarding the urban agriculture and community gardens ordinance as a Communication to the City Commission. In a voice vote, motion passed unanimously.

Motion made by Ms. Eckels, seconded by Ms. Castoro, to recommend the City Commission pass the attached FPL resolution (repeal of early cost recovery statute relating to electric utility charges). In a voice vote, motion passed 8-1 with Mr. Pollitt opposed.

[Discussed earlier]

8. Adjournment

With no further business to come before the Board at this time, the meeting was adjourned at 8:30 p.m.

Sustainability Advisory Board
November 28, 2011
Page 9

Next meeting date: January 23, 2012

Attachments:

Minutes – October 2011

[Minutes prepared by J. Opperlee, Prototype, Inc.]