

FINAL
CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE
SUSTAINABILITY ADVISORY BOARD
CITY HALL CONFERENCE ROOM
100 NORTH ANDREWS AVENUE – 8th Floor Conference Room
FORT LAUDERDALE, FLORIDA 33301
June 23, 2014 – 6:30 PM

				Cumulative Attendance 1/2014 through 12/2014	
MEMBERS	APPT BY	ATTENDANCE	PRESENT	ABSENT	
1. Valerie Amor, Chair	M	P(video)	6	0	
2. Alena Alberani, Vice Chair	II	A	3	3	
3. Daniel Ayers	M	P	6	0	
4. Steven Cook	I	P	6	0	
5. Vicki Eckels	IV	P	5	1	
6. William Goetz	I	P	2	0	
7. Darin Lentner	IV	P	4	2	
8. Jim Moyer	III	P	6	0	
9. Mate Thitisawat	C	P	4	2	
10. Cheryl Whitfield	III	P	6	0	
11. Jim Wood	II	A	1	2	

Also Present

Sustainability Division of Public Works

Dr. Nancy J. Gassman, Assistant Public Works Director – Sustainability Division
 Heather Steyn, Sustainability Specialist, SAB Staff Liaison

Presenter – Genetically Engineered Food Labeling

Mr. Fred Segal - President of the Broward County Farm Bureau and chair of the Broward Soil & Water Conservation District.

Call of Order/Roll Call

Chair Amor participated via Webex video conference. The meeting was called to order by Dr. Gassman at 6:34 pm, roll was called, and it was determined a quorum was present. A vote was held to elect a Chair Pro Tem (both the Chair and Vice-Chair were not physically present). Ms. Eckels was nominated by Mr. Ayers and seconded by Dr. Goetz. The Board unanimously approved the nomination. Chair Amor attended via computer link.

Approval of Meeting Minutes

Minor corrections to the April 28, 2014 meeting minutes were requested and Chair Pro Tem Eckels asked for a motion to approve the minutes of this meeting.

Motion made by Mr. Ayers to approve these minutes. In a voice vote, the Board motion passed unanimously.

Staff Liaison Report

Ms. Steyn provided highlights of the following announcement/events:

- ICMA City Links Exchange Program –The Legazpi Philippines delegation visited the City of Fort Lauderdale June 16-20. The four Legazpi members examined what the City and the region were doing relative to climate adaptation. Tours included stormwater planning in the City, a visit to the National Hurricane Center, the Broward County Emergency Operation Center, the South Florida Regional Water Management District and meetings with City staff to discuss City planning documents including ordinances/regulations. The delegation will determine what projects they will want to choose and staff from the City will travel back to Legazpi to work on the chosen projects in August/September.
- Proposed Adaptation Action Area Policies – This was successfully approved by City Commission and it will be going to an adoption hearing in September and once approved for transmittal to the State, this language will be incorporated in the City's Comp Plan.
- City Summer Youth Camp Initiative – The Sustainability Division worked with Parks & Recreation to develop an 8-week curriculum on Climate Change for 900 summer youth campers. The topics included an introduction to climate change, plant biodiversity, wildlife, waste reduction energy reduction, water conservation, etc. All campers received an Environmental Sustainability Steward certificate upon completion of the program.
- Landscape Ordinance Amendment – On June 17, city staff presented to Commission the benefits of using Florida-friendly Landscaping™ practices. This showed Commission the long-term benefits of water conservation and how this would meet the initiatives in the City's Strategic Plan. This presentation served as a precursor to future amendments to City ordinances.
- All-America City Award – The City received the award in Denver earlier this month.
- Hurricane Expo 2014 – Held at the War Memorial, approximately 530 participants and over 30 vendors attended the event.

Presentations

National Climate Assessment

- Since Chair Amor was attending via video conference, this presentation was postponed.

Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change

- Mr. Ayers discussed the new sustainable development guideline (for 2015-2030) developed by the United Nations (UN). This will be voted on by the UN in September 2014.
- He presented the goals of the guideline and how they could relate to the SAB such as water conservation, energy conservation, etc. The goals have target dates on when they will be achieved. For example, for climate change, targets to decarbonize the energy system in order to have clean energy for all were outlined. The guideline proposed target dates of 2030, 2040 and 2050 for actions. The developing world has increased their output of carbon due to increased manufacturing. The elimination of coal-fired energy is one of the key targets by 2050 as well as eliminating carbon generating vehicles by that time frame as well.
- Mr. Ayers handed out a list of websites to keep up with what is happening with the UN. The Board discussed elements of the presentation.

Urban Food Forest

- Ms. Whitfield agreed to postpone her presentation so that the Genetically Engineered Food Labeling discussion had sufficient time for public comment to occur. She will do it at a later time.

Old Business

Genetically Engineered Food

- Ms. Steyn handed out a letter from the Grocery Manufacturer's Association that came in today (6/23).
- Dr. Gassman discussed the SAB Communication that was presented to City Commission on 6/17 during the regular commission session (after being deferred from that day's Conference Agenda meeting). Some of the Commissioners expressed concern about receiving resolutions that seem to deviate from the action plans and priorities of the Commission. They felt it was not consistent with the Sustainability Action Plan itself. The resolution was sent back to the SAB based on a variety of comments but particularly because the Mayor felt the Board did not explore all sides of the issue and that it wasn't thoroughly vetted prior to making the recommendation to Commission. They requested that the Board hear alternative voices on the topic and discuss all sides of the issue prior to making a recommendation to Commission. The City did not vote nor take a stance on the issue.
- Board members felt that these were 2 issues. They asked if the Commissioners were aware of all of the documents distributed amongst the Board on this issue. The Mayor was contacted by the Farm Bureau who had not been contacted in relation to the resolution and the SAB did not have the opportunity to hear a counterpoint from that specific group. The Board was provided material in their packet from the agency that would be requiring the labeling. Staff contacted the Department of Agriculture and Consumer Services to provide the information in the packet.
- FDA information on genetically engineered foods (animals) was discussed. It was noted that there is a similar document on plants.
- Mr. Segal, President of the Broward County Farm Bureau and chair of the Broward Soil and Water Conservation District, asked that the Board to consider a slight modification of their resolution to support Federal legislation HR 4432, which would eliminate confusion of a state-by-state hodgepodge labeling law. This would be a uniform national labeling law and would require the FDA to conduct a safety review to evaluate any new GMO traits before they are introduced to commerce and empower FDA to mandate the labeling of GMO ingredients if they determine there is a health issue with a GMO trait. He discussed the various aspects of HR 4432.
- Board members asked if HR 4432 would ban states from banning GMO products. Mr. Segal agreed that it would prevent a state from requiring different labeling than a national label. His concern was that if there are a lot of local ordinances, the distributors of food products would not go to the added expense of labeling to match a local ordinance.
- Mr. Segal was asked whether this Bill HR 4432 was purely voluntary and Mr. Segal agreed. The Board noted that they are not passing legislation – just a recommendation. The SAB would rather support a local government action rather than something at the State or Federal level.

- Mr. Segal asked the Board to take a look at the Bill and consider it. Ms. Machado agreed that her resolution was geared toward the Federal level and it was her error which she thought would be corrected by the City Attorney's office.
- The Board felt that the resolution should be tabled so that they can review all sides. Members were asked to gather their articles and put them all into one file of information and after all the data was gathered, they would come back and either reaffirm their decision or decide to modify it.
- The Board voted to allow 20 minutes for public comment.

Public Comment

- Ms. Lazarow (Hallandale Beach City Commissioner) noted that the bills died in the State legislation but she feels that they will be coming out strong in the new session. She agreed that a resolution needs to be passed and she will be bringing it to her commission. They are hoping that Fort Lauderdale and the County supporting the resolution first. She asked that municipalities to move this resolution forward. She asked that the SAB push this resolution forward so that it will be passed by the City Commission.
- Ms. Machado (Food & Watch, Florida) clarified that this is a local resolution – not a local ordinance. She stated that this is an accessibility issue since labeling GMO will allow citizens choices in purchases. Board members stated that the language for the resolution should be standardized so that several municipalities would be willing to pass it.
- Mr. Madfis agreed with much of the discussion. He would like the resolution to be reworked and that it is critical for the City to pass the resolution since the City is a leader in Broward in many areas.
- Ms. Machado gathered 60 signatures for the GMO resolution for the transparency and labeling. Chair ProTem Eckels noted that the resolution should focus on the issues of transparency and the right to know.
- Ms. Sheldon (GMO-free Florida) discussed some examples of specific health issues related to GMO foods. She supports farmers that do not use GMO seeds. She noted that 65 countries have banned or required labeling for GMO foods.
- Ms. Machado will be bringing back a revised resolution. Board members requested that any scientific information on this topic be sent to Ms. Steyn for distribution to the Board.

Geoengineering Resolution/Urban Food Forest Presentation

- Ms. Whitfield's Geoengineering Resolution will be postponed until next month's meeting and included on that agenda.

New Business/Discussion

- For the next agenda, the only old business topic will be the genetic food resolution.

Board Communications

- None.

Public Comment

- See Genetically engineered food section.

Committee Comments:

Dr. Goetz

He asked that if anyone had any documents regarding electric vehicles to please send it to Ms. Steyn for distribution for the Board.

Mr. Moyer

He would like to discuss clothing recycling. He congratulates the City for becoming an All-America City.

Mr. Lentner

He noted that the Board had a good discussion about the resolution.

Mr. Cook

He discussed how a neighbor had to remove a clothesline since it was not permitted. He also talked about cycling issues and how he was not getting a response from people he's written a letter on this topic.

Ms. Whitfield

She is interested in hearing about the City's alternative fuel ideas.

Mr. Ayers

He talked about his trip to Holland and Germany including solar panels inclusion on buildings and lane separation for bicycles.

No Comment

- Ms. Eckels
- Chair Amor

Items for Next Meeting:

- Dr. Gassman asked the Board to specify the topics or presentations to include for the upcoming agenda.

Potential Presentation(s) for next meeting

- Third National Climate Assessment – Chair Amor
- Building Department – Solar Initiatives
- City Solar Initiatives – Dr. Gassman discussed how they will have meetings with FPL regarding solar sites within the City but those discussions will occur in July. They will talk about sites and a memorandum of understanding will be generated. SAB asked that the City's Building Department do a presentation on solar initiatives for 20 minutes including the Board's discussion.

Potential Presentation for Future Meeting

- Clothing recycling – Mr. Moyer

Forthcoming Discussions for next meeting

- Ms. Whitfield Geoengineering resolution
- Mr. Cook – Discussion about cycling in the City

Adjournment

With no further business to come before the Board at this time, the meeting adjourned at 8:35 pm.

Next meeting date: July 28, 2014 – 8th Floor Conference Room, City Hall [Minutes prepared by Mary Ann Johnston]